

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Bryan Andrada		12/5/2013	Email	I am extremely excited to see the local FS integrate downhill specific trails in their new management plan	New Trail Construction		Downhill biking - General support	1
Warren Williams	Coconino Trail Riders	11/16/2013	Phone	paraphrase: Supports consolidating sunset trailhead and restroom improvements	Trailhead Improvements		Trailhead improvements - General Support	2
Travis		12/4/2013	Email	I believe it is important for singletrack and downhill specific trails to be established, for multiple reasons. First with downhill trails in place there would be no need to have illegally built downhill trails, so no more fighting with the forest service. this would also eliminate the conflict between hikers and bikers on the downhill trails.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	3
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	I think it makes sense for the Forest Service to adopt several non-system trails, specifically Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger, to improve connectivity of existing and proposed trails. In addition, adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger would provide more recreational opportunities for varied skill levels of hikers, bikers, equestrian, etc.	New Trail Construction		Adopting social trails	4a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	It would make sense to see a new trail that begins roughly from the current Schultz Creek/Rocky Ridge Trailhead and ascending the South face of the Dry Lake Hills in the area of the current trail Lost Burrito. A sustainable trail that switch backed up the South face and merged into the proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop would provide an additional route choice to the top of Dry Lake Hills which would relieve user volume from Schultz Creek, Little Gnarly, Rocky Ridge and Brookbank. This new trail would provide a different user experience compared to Shultz Creek and Brookbank in that it would be on the South facing slope which would allow shoulder season access before the snow melts on Schultz Creek and Brookbank. Additionally, this trail would be easily accessed from town.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	4b
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	It would make sense to relocate the Schultz Creek Trailhead down to the Y at Schultz Pass Rd and Elden Lookout Rd. This change would allow 4-season access to the highly used trails of Rocky Ridge and Schultz Creek.	Trailhead Improvements		Relocated Schultz creek trailhead to the Y	4c
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	The proposal to create Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail along the base of Mt Elden is outstanding. I propose leaving Forces of Nature and the trails that connect from the pipeline east to Elden Lookout Trail as they are now. I propose adding the Class 4 trail below (south) of the existing trails in that area. It would make sense to locate the Class 4 trail in between the current trails such as Forces of Nature and the Pipeline. This would allow multiple user experiences in the same user corridor.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of the class 4 trail improvements	4d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	The proposed action of creating a Dry Lake Hills Loop is excellent. I propose expanding it to tie together a route that allows users to circumnavigate most, if not all the Dry Lake Hills Basin. This expanded loop would tie together rerouted Brookbank Jedi, Little Gnarly, Upper Brookbank, Pickle, Ginger and the previously proposed trail that would ascend the South face of Dry Lake Hills and merge into the Dry Lake Hills Loop. This would provide extensive user options from the Dry Lake Hills area for all skill levels and a wide variety of users.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of dry lakes loop	4e
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	I propose rerouting the Heart Trail so that it is both sustainable and usable by all user groups. This reroute would provide the same benefit that Little Bear provided by linking the Dry lake Hills area to the Little Elden Springs Trail and Schultz Tank area. A sustainable Heart Trail would link the Christmas Tree/Sandy Seep/Fat Man's Loop area to the Dry Lake Hills area. This would provide the east Flagstaff area with more direct access to the Dry Lake Hills area which would relieve pressure from other access points and disperse user visits.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		reroute of heart trail	4f
John Coe		12/2/2013	Email	I support the reroute of Upper Oldham as it is currently not sustainable or user friendly for all user groups. The adoption of Red Onion and Wasabi would dovetail well with this reroute.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support relocating upper Oldham	4g
Robert Hamilton		12/2/2013	Email	Please accept this letter as an endorsement of Flagstaff Biking Org's proposals and recommendations for the Mt. Elden Dry Lake Hills trails additions and realignments. These proposals are forward thinking and represent a sustainable approach to planning the recreational use of the MEDL trail system.	New Trail Construction		Fully supports FBO's proposed plan	5

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jeremy Morse		12/2/2013		adding the downhill specific bike trails to the system is a great idea. not only will it provide a greatly needed addition to the trails, if built properly, it will provide a train ground for younger, newer riders to hone their skills. with a progressively build set of technical trails, all levels of riders will be able to excel at the sport much faster, resulting in more fun.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	6a
Jeremy Morse		12/2/2013	Email	realignment of the lower brook bank trail (as proposed by FBO) would be an excellent alternative for bikers to ride to the top of mt Elden, as opposed to riding the forest service road (which I believe happens as a result of having mostly horribly eroded, steeply built trails that are not conducive to mountain biking). most riders prefer to pedal up to earn their rides down, but when the trails that provide a route up are only suitable for foot traffic (and barely in many cases such as lower brook bank, and upper Oldham), riders are forced onto the road. in my opinion, I don't even like to hike or run on lower brook bank. it is an erosional disaster.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		FBO's plan for Lower brook bank trail	6b
Jeremy Morse		12/2/2013	Email	upper elevation loops on the dry lakes, devils head, and mt Elden would make the experience richer for all users as any individual would have an opportunity to continue recreating for an extended time once reaching these areas, before beginning their descents. alternately, an individual that drives up and parks in these areas will also have an increased amount of trail opportunities to choose from, extending their time outdoors before returning to their vehicle.	New Trail Construction		Loop Trails on Dry Lakes	6c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jeremy Morse		12/2/2013	Email	as with bike specific trails, equestrians have a need for horse only trails as well. I fully support the idea of making loops for equestrians only on the northeast flanks of mt elden, or in any other areas deemed appropriate.	New Trail Construction		Support of equestrian trails	6d
jeremy morse		12/2/2013	Email	my list of trails to save, and revitalize goes as follows: 1. Wasabi 2. Ginger 3. Jedi 4. Red onion 5. Pickle 6. Prom night	New Trail Construction		Social trails to keep	6e
jeremy morse		12/2/2013	Email	the south elden trail looks like an excellent addition to the trail system, but i believe it should be a multi use trail, built in a fashion that provides for horses, bikers, as well as hikers to use it. i would also hope it provides yet another ascending route to the devils head/ mt elden stacked loops, & downhill bike loops. it would also make for many interesting loop opportunities in its own right with the existing trails, and proposed realignments!	New Trail Construction		Support South Elden Trail	6f
Jeremy morse		12/2/2013	Email	upper oldham reroute is drastically needed. i think this is one of our most appealing routes on the mountain, but the current alignment is horrible, and destroys all the potential enjoyment of the area it sits in. defining the flagstaff loop along the south side of mt elden is also highly needed. the social trails in the area have become so confusing,	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support for relocating Upper Oldham	6g

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jeremy morse		12/2/2013	Email	all of the trailhead improvements listed in the action seem very promising. a consolidated schultz pass, a new climbing specific TH on the lookout road, and increased parking at fatmans all seem needed. i would also like to see the "y" become the official schultz creek TH, and all of the existing social trails be purposefully built into a skills park/ dirt jumping area, 7 pumptrack instead of the rogue (unsafe) building that goes on there now. again, with a skills area being built in a progressive manner, it would provide an area for families to ride together, beginners to mingle with experts, and create a better bike community in general. this area could also have a fitness area similar to buffalo park.	Trailhead Improvements		Support of Shultz Pass trailhead to the Y	6h
jeremy morse		12/2/2013	Email	an alternate climbing and descending route to the dry lake hills from the schultz creek area would disperse the wear on the existing trails, while adding something new and interesting to the area.	New Trail Construction		new Trail ideas for dry lakes	6i
Andy Lane		12/1/2013	Email	I'd like to express my support for Flagstaff Biking Organization's position on the realignment and management of the Mt Elden/Dry Lake Hills trails. I especially think that the downhill trails in the area need to be adopted and improved.	New Trail Construction		Support of new trails, specifically Flagstaff Biking Organization's Proposed Trails.	7
Melissa Nelson		12/2/2013	Email	I support the adoption and creation of trails as outlined by FBO. We need even more. There is an increasing need for great trails near town to access the mountains and i would love to see creation of additional high quality trails through MEDL.	New Trail Construction		support of new trails, specifically Flagstaff Biking Organization's Proposed Trails.	8
Mike O'Donnell		12/2/2013	Email	I would also like to suggest the addition of a winter trail head for the area.	Trailhead Improvements		Trailhead Improvement Ideas	9a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Mike O'Donnell		12/1/2013	Email	I am writing to support the proposed changes especially the realignment of brookbank.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of trail relocation and improvements	9b
Scott Paulsel	SPECIALIZED BICYCLE COMPONENTS	12/1/2013	Email	I support the efforts and planning the Flagstaff Biking Organization is proposing.	New Trail Construction		Supports FBO's proposed plan	10
Erik Nelson		12/1/2013		I support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Shultz creek trail head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop.	New Trail Construction		Support of FBO's proposed plan.	11
Lars Romig	Verde Valley Cyclists Collalition	11/30/2013	Email	Creating trails that are use specific and labeled as such i.e. Downhill and Flow Trails.	New Trail Construction		Specific downhill trails in support of FBO's proposed plan	12a
Lars Romig	Verde Valley Cyclists Collalition	11/30/2013	Email	Relocating the Schultz Creek Trail Head is a great idea. Enhancing this trailhead to be a "hub" would be ideal. Adding in very detailed kiosks educating users on trail etiquette alongside more defined parking/amenity facilities.	Trailhead Improvements		Shultz Trailhead improvements- General Support	12b
Kyle		11/30/2013	Email	I also enjoy the downhill trails from time to time and wish to see these included. Pickle is another trail I would like to see added. more options to make loops.The Class 4 trail along the base of Mount Elden would be a great addition as well.	New Trail Construction		Support of downhill and biking specific trails.	13
Rick and Betty Smith		11/30/2013	Email	I see several advantages to the proposed South Elden Trail. (1) It would be accessible by foot or bike to many local residents; (2) since it would face south it would be clear of snow for a much longer season; and (3) there's the opportunity to design and build a truly low maintenance trail.	New Trail Construction		Support of Mt. elden south Trail	14
Brendon Potts		11/30/2013	Email	I would very much like to see Ginger and Jedi trails become part of the network. Red Onion trail is also an important access point to trails above the dry lake hills, and without it many other trails would crop up to fill its place because of what a great link it is.	New Trail Construction		Proposed social trails to be included	15a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Brendon Potts		11/30/2013	Email	I would like to make sure that Lower Brookbank does not get rerouted to the west. I agree with FBO, and think it would be a real pity, and a blow to Flagstaff's trail system if Forces were converted to a FUTS style trail. Such a trail would be a wonderful addition along the pipeline lower down Elden!	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Not supportive of trail relocation and improvement ideas.	15b
John Sawasky		11/30/2013	Email	I also worry about increased truck traffic on Lookout Road due to shuttlers. It is already pretty busy with people rushing up and down the mountain in trucks. Wouldn't it make more sense to build DH only trails at Snowbowl? I hope the intermediate trails will be kept or made as well.	New Trail Construction		Not Supportive of new downhill trails	16a
John Sawasky		11/30/201	Email	I would hate to see some of the more challenging UPHILL trails taken away. I enjoy going up as much as going downhill. I fear that the trails will either be super smooth, low grade, Ft. Valley style OR trails that are very steep, made for 5 inch to full on downhill bikes. I hope the intermediate trails will be kept or made as well.	New Trail Construction		Wants to maintain challenging uphill trails	16b
John Sawasky		11/30/2013	Email	Also, what about investing this money/time into getting Little Bear back on line first? It is a hugely popular trail with all user groups. I would hate to see it not be fixed first. Perhaps some bridges over the drainages?	Trail Relocation and Improvement		fix up little bear trail	16c
John Sawasky		11/30/2013	Email	I do not understand why Lower Brookbank would be closed if the new Lower Brookbank trail was made. It seems to me that the runners and hikers in town I know really use Lower Brookbank a lot, as it is the quickest, scenic route to Dry Lakes.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Keep Lower Brookbank Trail	16d
Robert Collis		11/30/2013	Email	Red Onion is a great connection to Sun Set, and could be great if the upper part was built correctly. The Flagstaff Loop Trail could be amazing, but it shouldn't trace the pipe-line road	New Trail Construction		Support of FBO's proposed new trail	17a
Robert Collis		11/30/2013	Email	The Flagstaff Loop Trail could be amazing, but it shouldn't trace the pipe-line road, a path that takes no consideration of natural terrain and contours of elevation. A real trail built for motorized traffic would be better for all users.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	17b
Robert Collis		11/30/2013	Email	FBO's proposals for re-alignments would make trails safer and more enjoyable for all users.	Other		support for FBO's proposed plan	17c
Robert Collis		11/30/2013	Email	Consolidating parking for Mt. Elden users at "The Y" would make sense.	Trailhead Improvements		Support of FBO's proposed plan for a "Y" trailhead	17d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Linden Lane		11/30/2013	Email	Red Onion helps to create many possible loops on the mountain without having to ride to the very top of Elden Lookout Road; and Jedi and Ginger trails offer a unique style of riding-aggressive, technical cross country. Loops. I believe there are many system trails in the area that need re-routing and extensive maintenance (especially the Hobbit Forest section of Sunset trail and Lower Brookbank).	New Trail Construction		support of including social trails	18a
Linden Lane		11/30/2013	Email	I would like to support the opportunity for permitted trail races (both bike and foot).	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special events use	18b
Linden Lane		11/30/2013	Email	I support the adoption and creation of a downhill trail system in Oldham Canyon.	New Trail Construction		downhill trail in oldham canyon	18c
Linden Lane		11/30/2013	Email	Speaking of trailheads, I absolutely support the creation of "real" trailheads at the "Y" and at the climbing area near Rocky Ridge. Bathrooms, signage, and sufficient parking would be a great addition to our recreational facilities.	Trailhead Improvements		schults creek trailhead moved to the Y	18d
Linden Lane		11/30/2013	Email	The signs for the AZ trail are confusing (since there is AZT A, B, etc) and some common loop connectors like Little Gnarly have no signs at all. Also, a few additional kiosks with system maps would be great.	Trailhead Improvements		support of increased trail signage	18e
John Neff		11/29/2013	Email	Revival of the Deer Hill Trail doesn't seem to be in this mix. It might not be as hard as keeping the Elden Springs line passable. It may be that a designed set of horse trails below the horse camp will lure that user group to resume riding from Timberline residences, thereby reviving the connectors official and social that we used to use.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Not supportive of the Deer Hill Trail Revival	19a
John Neff		11/29/2013	Email	Since the burn, we of the east side are diverted to the north or south for dog walks and so forth. In renewing our acquaintance with the Sandy Seep we agree that a new alignment on contour, away from the retired jeep track, would be lovely.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support for realignment of sandy sheep	19b
John Neff		11/29/2013	Email	I like the idea of creating a loop trail from Mt Elden lookout off the southwest side. There are ways for hikers to loop, but a more obvious connection is good.	New Trail Construction		support of south elden trail	19c
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	Except in cases where social trails achieve a multi-use goal that is currently lacking in the existing Forest Service trail network, all social trails should be closed and not incorporated into the trail network.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		decomision social trails instead of including them in the plan	20a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	The new South Elden Trail is not necessarily a good idea. Unlike the Elden Lookout Trail, which climbs a forested gully, the planned alignment of the Elden Lookout Trail takes it across up a sparsely vegetated gully and then across a bedrock nose. Building this trail will require a lot of rock cutting and work. I see no way that this new trail will not be an eyesore on the south face of Mount Elden and not cause erosion problems near the Devil's Chair.	New Trail Construction		Agaisnt south elden trail	20b
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	A better use of funds in this project would be to upgrade the existing trailheads and actually maintain the existing multi-use trails.	Other		better use of funds	20c
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	I also do not see the need for the two new loops on the tops of the Dry Lake Hills and Mount Elden. These loops will bring people into areas that are currently not highly visited and used by wildlife. The south Dry Lake is currently a quiet place to watch wildlife as is Turkey Park. Adding more people to these areas will degrade this experience.	New Trail Construction		Agaisnt dry lakes loop	20d
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	The trailhead consolidation/movements planned make no sense for hikers. The Sunset and Schultz Pass trailhead parking areas serve different purposes. The Sunset trailhead makes no sense as the starting point for hiking the Weatherford Trail, just as the Sunset trailhead makes no sense as the starting point for the Schultz Loop Trail. Closing the Little Elden Spring parking area will negatively impact hikers and climbers. The current location of this parking area serves an important purpose for accessing the Arizona Trail (Little Elden) and Little Bear Trails for hiking. It might be ok to add miles to a bike trip or horseback trip, but not to hike. This parking area also serves as an access point to climbing on the Elysian Buttress. Moving the Brookbank trailhead will make no sense if the trail is merely upgraded in its current location.	Trailhead Improvements		Against consolodating trailheads	20e
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	No new trails should be built that are not multi-use, meaning that they will be a positive experience for hiking, biking, and horseback riding. The Forest Service should not be building or sanctioning trails for a single-use activity, such as downhill biking	New Trail Construction		not supportive of downhill/single use trails	20f
David Topping		11/29/2013	Email	The current location of the Brookbank trail may be difficult for bikers, but it is a great alignment for hikers. It serves as the quickest route to the top of the Dry Lake Hills. If the problem with this trail alignment is erosion, why then is the plan to relocate it to the next drainage to the south that will have its own erosion problems?	Trail Relocation and Improvement		increase the maintenance on brookbank trail instead of realign it	20g

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
James Gibson		11/27/2013	Email	I don't want existing trails eliminated! Many of the existing trails (i.e., Red Onion, Jedi, Ginger) exist because of a need. I would like to see existing trails modified or re-routed, but NOT destroyed or eliminated. I would love to see FUTS added along the base of Elden to Schultz Pass, but would like to have it aligned so that it does NOT eliminate existing trails, i.e., Forces of Nature. I support downhill trails as part of the trail system.	New Trail Construction		Wants to keep all social trails	21a
James Gibson		11/27/2013	Email	I would like to see Hart Trail re-aligned so that it is useful, and part of the trail system. It would be an invaluable addition to the trail system, providing many options for loops that would include it.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Re-align hart-trail	21b
Patrick Kell	International Mountain Bicycling Association	11/27/2013	Email	We support the reclassification of the Flagstaff Loop Trail to Class 4, which will serve a vital and often underserved segment of the mountain bike population, beginners.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		General Support of Flagstaff loop Trail	22a
Patrick Kell	International Mountain Bicycling Association	11/27/2013	Email	We are also very pleased to see the addition of 3.5 miles of downhill specific mountain bike trail in the proposed action.	New Trail Construction		General support of downhill trails	22b
Wayne Anderson		11/27/2013	Email	Map 7 shows the Forces of Nature Trail at the foot of South Mount Elden. Please keep the single track available for mountain biking and improve much of the pipeline for a FUTS type trails. This will keep bikers and hikers more separated. Secondly the idea of a nice big wide trail for baby strollers etc. is very exciting. Please do not replace single track with this Walking Trail.	New Trail Construction		Keep forces of nature trail	22a
Wayne Anderson		11/27/2013	Email	I really like the ideas of... <ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Access for Climbers (Map 4) o Hang Gliders (Overview) o More Hiking Trails (such as the trail going up the south side of Elden going toward Devils head). o Downhill mountain bikers trails. o More loops up on top of the Dry Lakes 	Other		General support	22b
Wayne Anderson		11/27/2013	Email	Map 3 shows a reroute of Brookbank over what I think is called Ginger. After hiking this area, I think a reroute of Brook Bank would work better in the existing Brook Bank corridor. Simple rerouting the trail to incorporate better building strategies	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Reroute of brookbank	22c
Wayne Anderson		11/27/2013	Email	Not sure if it is part of the plan, but I would like to see an improved trail up in to the Buffalo Park from Lower Oldham. Currently that is a rocky mess	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Trail improvement idea	22d
Neil Weintraub		12/1/2013	Email	relocate Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		Relation of shultz trailhead	23a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Neil Weintraub		12/1/2013	Email	align the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area. move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed realignment to the east. The FBO alignment would make for a much better trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Alignment of Flagstaff Loop Trail and lower brookbank	23b
Neil Weintraub		12/1/2013	Email	add upper Red Onion trail into the system to provide additional trail opportunities. Add Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		Proposed socials trails to be added	23c
Neil Weintraub		12/1/2013	Email	add a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stackedloops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills	New Trail Construction		Proposed new trail	23d
Neil Weintraub		12/1/2013	Email	Add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system	New Trail Construction		Proposed new trail	23e
Joseph E Hazel Jr		11/30/2013	Email	There needs to be an established, four season trailhead at the Schultz Y with a pit toilet and trash cans.	Trailhead Improvements		Shultz Trailhead	24a
Joseph E Hazel Jr		11/30/2013	Email	I suggest the lower Brookbank reroute follow the original routing proposed by Flagstaff Biking Organization and the non-system trail Ginger be improved/rerouted and brought into the current system. Routing Brookbank up the steep canyon that Ginger is in will be problematic and require numerous, steep switchbacks. The original routing was more on contour. This should not be a "kill two birds with one stone" approach.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Lower Brookband Trail	24b
Joseph E Hazel Jr		11/30/2013	Email	My main criticism of the proposal is that it results in a net reduction of downhill trails and I suggest Ginger be added back in. I also noticed Jedi was not included and I recommend this trail be incorporated into the plan as it offers a riding experience not provided by the only other trail in the area, Little Gnarly. There is substantial hiker traffic on Little Gnarly and Jedi helps disperse the use. A southside or frontside trail that begins on the west side of the proposed Dry Lake Hills perimeter trail loop and descends to near the bottom of Schultz Creek trail will help disperse the use on what is perhaps the most utilized trail in the entire system. I believe the most user-conflicts and congestion occur on Schultz Creek trail. This proposed alternative will also replace Lost Burrito which is a very popular hiking trail and will also maximize the "stacked-loops" concept being proposed for the the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		Does not want a loss of downhill trails	24c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joseph E Hazel Jr		11/30/2013	Email	Red Onion is a valuable connector that allows user-access from the Elden side of Dry Lake Hills without having to climb all the way to the top of Elden. I believe this trail should be included in the plan and a connector routed from the bottom to join the proposed Upper Oldham reroute.	New Trail Construction		Support of Red Onion Trail	24d
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support relocating the Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz Y" City Parcel and to help protect this property as open space and a trail head!	Trailhead Improvements		Support of relocating Schultz trailhead	25a
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support the recommended aligning of the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden as long as the current Mt. Elden trail will still be used.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff Loop Trail	25b
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	Red Onion trail should be considered as an important permanent and official FS trail, because it is important to have a connector from/to Mt. Elden road as an alternative to Sunset and Little Bear for those who need a place to "bail out" because of fatigue or for emergence situations.	New Trail Construction		Support of Red Onion Trail	25c
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	25d
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	There should be more opportunities for downhill trails, even though I am not a "downhill" rider, provided they are well-managed for this use, which will help minimize user conflicts, and thus allowing the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts.	New Trail Construction		more downhill trails	25e
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. Please continue to maintain the current Brookbank Trail for us who like a tough, technical challenging ride.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Lower Brookbank Trail Alignment	25f
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		Proposed new trail	25g
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	Please support to build the Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		support of Ginger and Jedi	25h
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with way-finding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		General Support	25i

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action!!! I support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action!	New Trail Construction		General Support- new trails	25j
Shawn Skalebund		11/30/2013	Email	I support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		General Support Special Events	25k
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	This project seems to be slanted toward the needs of cyclists and the needs of hikers seem to be underrepresented.				26a
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	Keep both trailheads. Consolidating these two into just the Sunset trailhead will increase the distance to hike the already long Weatherford trail. The current Sunset trailhead is in a nice location that would be negatively impacted by enlarging it. The redundancy of maintenance shouldn't really be significant since there doesn't seem to be much at the Sunset trailhead and travel time for this maintenance would be negligible. Does it make sense to remove the facilities that already exist at the Schultz Tank parking area, only to have to rebuild them at the Sunset trailhead? Separating out the users is a good way to keep the experiences of all more enjoyable and I think having both parking areas is a good thing	Trailhead Improvements		Do not combine Sxhultz Trailheads	26b
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	Build a new trailhead and keep the Little Elden trailhead. I can support the proposed equestrian trailhead out at Hwy 89, BUT decommissioning the Little Elden Spring trailhead would adversely affect hiker's access to the Little Bear trail. Please leave this parking area accessible to hikers.	Trailhead Improvements		Keep Little elden trailhead	26c
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	Do not decommission the current Brookbank trail and build another, longer trail. Improvements to this trail could be done instead of relocating it. Impacts to wildlife must be minimal or non-existent as this trail has been there and been used for a long, long time. Wildlife impacts would be far greater if a new, longer trail is built. This new trail would impact areas that see few people now. The difference in length between the current and proposed trails is significant and convenient, relatively quick access that is important to many hikers would be lost. Connectivity of the trailheads from Elden Lookout Road seems very reasonable as it is now.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Keep current brookbank trail	26d
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	PLEASE, PLEASE do not construct the Dry Lake Hills Loops. This area is very special and is deserving of keeping in its current, pristine state. Preservation just for the wildlife alone is reason enough. It is a far less visited area that is cherished by many hikers who must know how to get there to make a visit. This is a perfect example of an area to leave alone.	New Trail Construction		Agaisnt Dry lakes loop	26e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Karen Mattingly		11/302013	Email	I have also used the Upper Oldham trail extensively for many, many years and have always appreciated it as another fairly quick trail to the top. It appears the lower portion is proposed to be used for gravity riding trails so the erosion concerns don't seem to be valid. A longer, rerouted trail does not appeal to me if there is not a better reason to do it and rerouting it so that the gravity riders can have their trails would not get my support	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Upper Oldham Trail	26f
Karen Mattingly		11/302013	Email	Proposed West Elden Trailhead and Climbing Area Access: Since human waste is currently an issue constructing a restroom sounds like a good idea and it could be useful for others in the area. Since I don't use the climbing area I can't comment on the need for a trail, but I would have concerns about the size of the parking area if it involves cutting a significant amount of trees.	Trailhead Improvements		Support of West Elden Climbing Access	26g
Karen Mattingly		11/302013	Email	These downhill trails don't belong in the MEDL area. There must be far more appropriate places for these types of trails to be built. I don't know much about gravity riding, but it seems to be dangerous and destructive. Let's find another place to accommodated them and increase enforcement so that illegal trials do not continue to be built.	New Trail Construction		Agaisnt downhill trails	26h
Karen Mattingly		11/302013	Email	I am not necessarily against the hang glider launch pad, but I haven't seen a hang glider coming off of Elden in a very long time. How popular is this sport these days? Has the anticipated use been studied? Is it really needed? My biggest concerns would be the cutting of trees to accommodate this use. .	Hang Glider Launch Site		Uncertain on Hang Glider Launch Site	26i
Karen Mattingly		11/302013	Email	The new trail on the south face of Elden had me excited at first, but the reality is that I would likely use it very infrequently. That part of Elden has always been a bit of a mystery to me and I like that. I think this is another area that is best left alone. I suspect that wildlife disruption would also occur here with the amount of trail needed to get to the top. There are plenty of other trails heading up Elden that can be connections with each other. From a practical standpoint, it seems construction costs would be very high for this one in particular due to the rocky terrain. I suspect use would be light on this trail due to exposure, length and the distance needed just to get to the trailhead.	New Trail Construction		Against south elden trail	26j
Karen Mattingly		11/302013	Email	I have no objection to the realignment of the Lower Oldham and Flagstaff Loop trail improvement. These improvements could be beneficial to these highly used areas.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of trail improvments	26k

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	The proposed Scenic Loop trail appears to provide access to the downhill trails and hang glider launch pad. It may be misleading to invite hikers to use this trail if they may be over run by bikes. Increased use of Elden Lookout Road is of concern due to dust, maintenance and increased vehicle traffic impacting other users.	New Trail Construction		Concern over scenic loop trail	26l
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area: I support these improvements in this highly used area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		General support Environemtnal study area	26m
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	I support increasing the trailhead parking, but not toward Elden. Expanding toward the highway would be acceptable and could it be expanded from the sides also? Removing trees should be a last resort. How about restrooms?	Trailhead Improvements		Support of Elden parking improvments	26n
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	This project seems to be slanted toward the needs of cyclists and the needs of hikers seem to be underrepresented. While I understand that the USFS needs to consider all types of users, this project seems to be sacrificing the MEDL area to meet too many of those needs and it has a Disneyland feel to it. The MEDL area has plenty of trails without building more and I believe funds could be better spent improving existing trails, trailheads, signage and parking areas. This abundance of trails already disburses users and provides many options. Unauthorized trail building is a very real problem and I strongly feel this needs to be addressed as an enforcement issue. I don't believe more of the MEDL area needs to be developed. This plan will bring more people to parts of the area that now see little to no use. Wildlife and resource impacts should be lessened, not increased. We need to protect these areas by leaving them alone and not increasing widespread use.	Other		Generaly agaisnt MEDL	26o
Karen Mattingly		11/30/2013	Email	I became aware of the MEDL rather late in the game and feel that enough public notification was not given considering the large scope of the project and that this area is used by so many people of differing interests.	Other		Not enough pulic notice and too sort a comment period	26p
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Recommend relocating Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Ask for the US Forest Service to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		Move schults trailhead to the "Y"	27a
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Propsoed flagstaff loop trail allignment	27b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Recommend adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. Explain the importance of the connectivity of this trail to the system. Recommend adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		Support of including social trails	27c
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	27d
Stephanie McCarthy			Email	Recommend maximizing opportunities for downhill trails. Even if you are not a "downhiller", providing well-managed opportunities for this use helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	27e
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. We have hiked this area extensively and our alignment would make for a much better trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of FBO's proposed placement of lower brookbank	27f
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	27g
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action! There is some great stuff in this proposal. Even though some of the trails will be focused on other uses, they will still be open to bicycles and will help disperse use and provide some great opportunities for our friends who hike, trail run and ride horses.	New Trail Construction		General support of new trail construction	27h
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with wayfinding in this area	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		General support of environmental study area	27i
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		General support of trail relocation and improvement	27j
Stephanie McCarthy		11/30/2013	Email	Support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		General support of special use events	27k

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Tom Bida		11/30/2013	Email	Any new trail development should avoid impacting wildlife habitat and migration, and unique ecosystems, to the highest degree possible. Also, new trail development in steep, erosive terrain should be avoided. Consolidation of parking areas is a good idea.	New Trail Construction		General support of new trail construction	28a
Tom Bida		11/30/2013	Email	Brookbank trail closure: Reasons for closure of the existing Brookbank trail don't seem clear. This trail follows a well established route and remediation will take a long time, especially since use of the trail corridor will inevitably continue.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		against closing brookbank trail	28b
Tom Bida		11/30/2013	Email	Brookbank reroute: The new route goes into steep terrain that will be highly impacted by the new trail. Also, is the new Dry Lake hills loop really necessary? The existing trail from the top of Brookbank to the overlook above this gulch already serves the primary purpose of providing access to that expansive view, and could be simply improved. The other routes on the top of Dry Lake hills could also be similarly improved without building new connecting trails in undeveloped terrain (i.e. around the S and SE loops).	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Agaisnt Dry lakes loop	28c
Tom Bida		11/30/2013	Email	Might a better option for downhill bike riding in the region be implemented at Arizona Snowbowl, an area already heavily impacted and cleared? In fact the new network looks like a set of downhill ski trails. We have also noted that the Arizona trail segment descending from Snowbowl has become deeply rutted due to downhill bike use. It seems likely that the Brookbank reroute could suffer from similar abuse.	New Trail Construction		Agaisnt downhill trails	28d
Tom Bida		11/30/2013	Email	FBO proposal for Shultz-Dry Lakes connecting trail: Again, this proposed trail by FBO would traverse currently undeveloped terrain and is not endorsed here. We observed a brown bear this summer descending from these slopes into Shultz Creek, where the bear turned around before reaching the new Shultz creek trail on the slopes; it seemed the bear was deterred by the trail itself. Another trail above this area could be very disturbing to wildlife.	New Trail Construction		against FBO Schultz-dry lakes connecting trail	28e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Based on comments we have received from our members and talks with your staff the SOPA schedule of this project is way too ambitious. As you know there are two other planning efforts going on concurrently with the Recreation Plan – revising the Forest Plan; and the Watershed Protection Project. These three planning projects together will dramatically effect the management of the Mt. Elden/Dry Lakes area and we feel it is important that they not be done independent of each other. Obviously the Watershed Protection Project is a priority, is on a fast track, and will be completed first. But in implementing this project it should be done in a manner that will compliment and supplement the goals of the Recreation Plan. Since the Forest Plan is being revised during the same time frame as the Recreation Plan, there is confusion as to which Forest Plan (the current or the revised) will be driving the direction of forest management as it applies to the Recreation Plan. We ask that you finalize the Recreation Plan following the finalization of the Forest Plan and the completion of the Watershed Protection Project. 	Other		Agaisnt MEDL due to timing with other projects	29a
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Your effort to provide a full range of a non-motorized recreation opportunity spectrum (ROS) is too ambitious. Taking the mileage of all the trails added together, the use of existing roads and trail heads in providing access, combined with the wide range of recreation uses being contemplated within the context of increasing population pressures, we are very concerned that the area will be overwhelmed for quality experiences and that resource degradation will occur. 	New Trail Construction		Concern over too many trails in the project area	29b
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club		Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some of the specific recreation opportunities being contemplated possess a high potential for abuse, safety/accident concerns, and ecological degradation and quite frankly, are just inappropriate for a national forest. While the national forests accommodate multiple uses, it does not mean that they must accommodate every use. Foremost of concern is the promotion and accommodation of “Gravity Riding” recreation. This proposal by its nature, will undoubtedly have severe ecological impacts and user conflicts. It also is an activity that is shuttle dependent which goes against the goal of non-motorized recreation use of the area 	New Trail Construction		Concern of environmental abuse to specific activites	29c
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	<p>Another concern is the hang-gliding accommodation. This activity may be acceptable, but the planning and implementation should contain ample opportunity for public input targeting its specifics. We would like you to break this use out of the general recreation plan and address it as a separate issue, although on a concurrent basis.</p>	Hang Glider Launch Site		against hang glicer laugh site	29d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	the Dry Lakes and Turkey Park areas will provide access for illegal "down-hilling" and meadow degradation; the South Face Mt. Elden trail, with its sweeping switchbacks, encourages bicyclists building up speed in their downward traverse; and the Shultz Creek Trail, with its proximity to the ecologically important Shultz Creek, should be considered for relocation.	New Trail Construction		conern over illegal downhill use	29e
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	An analysis of the placement of gates should include one east of the proposed West Elden Trail Head climbing area parking lot. It would be open only for service vehicles and permitted activities. This upper gate would eliminate the need for the proposed Elden Scenic trailhead. Other gates to consider is one near where the Fort Valley trail intersects Schultz Pass road; and one near the trailhead(s) at Schultz Tank and Sunset trail. The purpose of these gates is to manage the vehicular traffic on Schulz Pass road so as to protect Schultz Creek. An analysis of trailheads should include closing and rehabilitating the Schultz Creek and "Y" trailheads in cooperation with the City of Flagstaff. Another trailhead to consider would be the placement of one near where the Fort Valley trail intersects Schultz Tank road. Also, the proposed equestrian trailhead at Hwy. 89 should be further evaluated as to its need and associated expense.	Trailhead Improvements		proposed trailhead and gate ideas	29f
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A concern of new trails and trailheads is their impact on wildlife. This is an issue of concern and we are assuming that the Forest Service will have a comprehensive analysis of impacts and also make every effort that wildlife is not harmed. 	New Trail Construction		conern over wildlife impact from new trails	29g
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> We are greatly concerned that existing law enforcement will not be sufficient to deal with the accomplishment of the Plan's goals and objectives. Law enforcement should be given considerable administrative weight, adequate financing, and be an integral part of the recreation plan. 	Other		not enough Law enforcment to monitor the area	29h
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	We ask for the establishment of a panel of concerned citizens to continually assess recreational needs, user conflicts and environmental impacts of the Study Area. This panel will assist recreation planners in assuring that Trail Management Objectives (TMO), as well as Forest Plan Goals and Objectives, are being monitored and met.	Other		Increase monitoring of the area	29i
Betsy and Steve McKellar	Plateau Group of the Sierra Club	11/30/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Recreation Plan did not address management objectives or strategies concerning the overabundance of user created trails in the area at the end of Fourth Street and how the area will be rehabilitated. 	New Trail Construction		Not enough focus on the user created trails	29j

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Merrill Birdno		11/29/2013	Email	<p>I would advocate for the inclusion of more of the user-built social trails, including Upper Red Onion, Ginger, and Jedi, as recommended by the FBO. In addition to these, I would like to see the Wasabi, Lower Red Onion, and Private Reserve Trails included in essentially the same condition as they now exist. The user-built trails are, for the most part, well-constructed and built to resist erosion, as attested by their longevity through even a severe monsoon season like our most recent summer.</p> <p>Additionally, they are built with features that are specifically aimed at meeting the needs of advanced riders. There are more user-built downhill trails (in number) than there are proposed downhill forest-service built trails. I think this fact indicates that there is a bigger need for these types of trails than what is included in the proposal.</p>	New Trail Construction		Proposed inclusion of social trails for downhill use	30a
Merrill Birdno		11/29/2013	Email	<p>In addition to including more of the user-built trails in the plan, I would ask that the Forest Service keep the features that make these trails unique and desirable to advanced riders. For example, the Jedi trail includes a dozen or more "log rolls" (there may be a more accurate term). These are locations on the trail where a large log is laying perpendicular to the trail and several smaller logs/branches are placed at the base of the larger log to provide a way to navigate your bike over the log. These are important and challenging features of these trails and should be maintained. The point to remember here is that the enjoyment of these trails is not just due to the absolute location of the trail, but more importantly due to the specific challenging features that push your skills and provide opportunities for improvement. Please be aware that removal of these features is not considered trail improvement or maintenance by those who currently use these trails because of their challenging nature. There are many easier options available (both in terms of other trails and even simply walking the bike over obstacles) for those who don't want to ride over/through these features.</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Concern over trail improvement	30b
Merrill Birdno		11/29/2013	Email	<p>I would also ask that the Forest Service reconsider their decision to leave Little Gnarly off of the plan. This is an important connector to get from the Dry Lake Hills to the Schultz Creek Trail.</p>	New Trail Construction		Include little gnarly trail	30c
Merrill Birdno		11/29/2013	Email	<p>I am concerned that the trail closures will take place first, followed by a long, slow building of new trails. This would put undue trail pressure and increase the risk of cyclist-cyclist and cyclist-hiker collisions. Please refrain from any trail closures until the new routes are completed and open.</p>	Other		Concern over trail closures	30d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	If the Forest Service truly wants “a chance to engage in meaningful dialogue” (as stated in the scoping letter) it should extend the comment period for at least 60 days to ensure that all potential issues have been properly scoped.	Other		Need a longer scoping period	31a
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	: I understand that the determination of whether an Environmental Impact Statement is needed will be part of the Environmental Assessment process; however, I believe that the significance of this project rises to the level that it should trigger an EIS.	Other		MEDL should require and EIS	31b
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	If the Forest Service is truly committed to addressing “impacts to natural resources such as wildlife, watershed and soil conditions, recreational experience and vegetation” it should begin removing illegal trails now.and include, but are not limited to: • Jedi• View Point• Prom Night• Weenie Walk• Red Onion• Wassabi• Private Reserve• Pickle• Little Granary• Climb 3	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		agasint social trails	31c
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	In the project purpose and need section, the Forest Service fails to mention the need for people to enjoy solitude and quiet. Some of areas of the MEDL area should not be developed, providing a space for people to relax and enjoy the area, especially the area around the westernmost wetland, where I have frequently seen wildlife.	Other		general concern with MEDL	31d
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	: As I understand, the Flagstaff Watershed Protection Project will be ramping up during the next few years. I did not see a reference (except for the reference in the hang glider section) to that project in the Proposed Action. The Forest Service needs to provide the public with detailed information about how the two overlap and what the agency is planning regarding coordination between the two.	Other		Cocern over the overlap with Flagstaff watershed protection	31e
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	.I object to trails being designated for a single type of user. However, if the Forest Service is going to restrict trail use, then it should include some trails in the Proposed Action that are restricted to hikers, so those of us who prefer walking in peace and quiet are not subject to bikes barreling down the trail with riders yelling to each other.	New Trail Construction		Hiking only trails	31f
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	My only concern is that building new trails continues to fragment the MEDHL area, which I believe could have an impact on the ecology of the area. For instance, every new trail is a vector for invasive plant species. Are horses on these trails required to be fed with weed-free feed? If not, the Forest Service should require it.	New Trail Construction		Concern over horse trails	31g

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	I'd prefer that Mt. Elden not be chopped up by more trails, but I must admit that I find the idea of a trail up the south side of the mountain interesting, primarily because it could make a good loop hike. If the Forest Service decides to construct this trail, I suggest that it meet the pipeline trail further east. If that is not done, it will take little time for an unauthorized trail to develop by people who do not want to walk an extra mile west when their goal is to go back to the Elden Lookout trailhead	New Trail Construction		Mt. Elden south face trail support	31h
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	West Elden Climbing Access Trail (map 4) I have no experience with the existing trails, but the impacts seem to be quite contained, so I think the idea of making the trails part of the official trail system is fine.	New Trail Construction		Support of West Elden Climbing Access	31i
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	The proposed scenic loop trail on top of Mt. Elden and accompanying parking lot have the potential to dramatically increase the amount of traffic driving up the lookout road, which will significantly affect air quality in the drainage. While I enthusiastically support the idea of providing good recreational experiences, I think that the Forest Service should be promoting the idea of parking at the base of Mt. Elden and the Dry Lakes to minimize vehicular impacts on hiking.	New Trail Construction		agaisnt the scenic loop trail	31j
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	Dry Lake Hills Trail System (map 3) I frequently see and hear wildlife at the seasonal wetland at the western end of Dry Lake Hills. I strongly encourage the Forest Service to drop the idea of a loop around the wetland. Currently, it is one of the quietest, most remote spots in the MEDL area, and it needs to remain that way. Wetlands on the south side of the San Francisco peaks are incredibly rare and the Forest Service needs to recognize their critical importance to wildlife. As climate change continues to affect the region, wetlands will become even more critical for any number of species.	New Trail Construction		Agaisnt dry lakes loop trail	31k
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	General Trail Signage and Information: I support the idea of providing enough signs/information to help users negotiate the MEDL trail system. I encourage the Forest Service to keep them as small and unobtrusive as possible.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of increased signage	31l
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	Relocating existing authorized trails should only be done if it is not possible to address erosion and other resource concerns. I wonder how the Forest Service has the money to ralign and relocate trails when it apparently does not have the money to maintain the existing trails.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		concern over reloacting existing trails	31m

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	The existing Brookbank Trail should not be relocated. Instead the Forest Service should install erosion control features. This trail is a short way to get to the top of the Dry Lake Hills. The proposed relocated trail is not only much longer, it also goes up a drainage, so why move it?	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Agaisnt brookbank tail relocation	31n
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	As mentioned above, trails should only be relocated if upgrading existing trails is not possible, so I support keeping the Upper Oldham where it is. Map 3 shows the Upper Oldham being decommissioned, yet Map 5 shows the gravity rider trails using the lower end of the decommissioned alignment. The Forest Service expresses the need to get trails out of drainages to address wildlife and erosion concerns, yet it is allowing one of the most erosive activities (downhill riders hitting their brakes) in the bottom of a drainage. While it is true that there is significant erosion at the lower end of the Upper Oldham, I see no reason why water bars could not significantly diminish the erosion. I ask the Forest Service to explain why it can't control erosion on this trail, but it apparently believes it can control erosion on gravity rider trails coming almost straight down the mountain.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Keep upper oldham where it is	31o
Rick Moore			Email	Lower Oldham Relocation/Flagstaff Loop Trail Improvement (see map 6) I support this. It makes sense to provide an alternative bike route along the northern side of Flagstaff and this is in what is essentially an urban area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of lower oldham relocation	31p
Rick Moore			Email	Consolidate Schultz Tank and Sunset Trailheads (see map 1) I support keeping both of these trailheads. Closing the Schultz tank trailhead adds distance to the Weatherford hike and since it already exists (complete with a pit toilet), why spend the money to close and reclaim it? The Sunset trailhead is in a nice meadow, and expanding the parking lot substantially would mean that much of the meadow would be destroyed and intimacy If the existing small parking lot would be lost. I believe that smaller parking lots are much more compatible with natural areas than large ones reminiscent of parking lots in the middle of cities.	Trailhead Improvements		Agaisnt combining trailhead	31q
Rick Moore			Email	Relocate Little Elden Trailhead (map 2) Decommissioning this parking lot makes absolutely no sense. If it is decommissioned, the nearest trailheads for hiking out and back on the Little Bear will almost double the length of the hike. It is also a great spot to park and picnic in the surrounding area which has some wonderful boulders.	Trailhead Improvements		Against decomissioning little elden trailhead	31r

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	I support the idea of a parking lot by the climbing area as part of an effort to encourage people to park at the bottom of M. Elden and the Dry Lake Hills. Ideally, the Forest Service would close the Elden Lookout road except for administrative use to access the towers. However, if that does not happen, then I'm concerned that parking where the Upper Oldham intersects the lookout road will be removed. Hiking only the Upper Oldham is a favorite hike and adding a long section of trail right next to the Elden Lookout road (with the increased traffic driving to the new parking lot and loop trail on top) would both add distance and cause a negative impact on the overall experience	Trailhead Improvements		Support of West Elden Climbing Access	31s
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	Elden Lookout Trailhead Expansion (map 8) I suggest that the parking lot not be expanded into the trees, but if necessary, be expanded parallel to the highway with adequate screening and landscaping so it is not quite so obvious to motorists.	Trailhead Improvements		Suggestion on Elden lookout trailhead expansion	31t
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	Special Use Trail Events I strongly support the need to mitigate the impacts of special events on natural and cultural resources, as well as conflicts with other users. In addition to the proposed mitigation efforts identified in the Proposed Action, the Forest Service should limit the size (number of participants) of the events, clearly explain those limitations in the EA, and analyze the potential impacts of the both the participants and the crowds that may attend them.	Special-Use Trail Events		special use events	31u
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	The Proposed Action states in the Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning section that trails and roads that are "not being incorporated into the FS system and are located in sensitive resource areas" will be decommissioned. All trails and roads not being incorporated into the FS trail system should be decommissioned, so the "located in sensitive resource areas" phrase should be removed.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		Trail and road decomissioning	31v
Rick Moore		11/29/2013	Email	Hang Glider Launch Site: This is another activity that encourages people to drive to the top of Mt. Elden, which as stated elsewhere will affect air quality and the hiking experience in the drainage where the road is located. I don't support any action that will encourage vehicular traffic to the top of the mountain.	Hang Glider Launch Site		against the hang glider launch site	31w
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	Support for Relocating Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Ask for the US Forest Service to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		supportive of relocating schultz creek trailhead	32a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	Support for Aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of Flagstaff loop trail	32b
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	Adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. Explain the importance of the connectivity of this trail to the system. Adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		Support of including social trails	32c
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	32d
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	Maximizing opportunities for downhill trails. Even if you are not a "downhiller", providing well-managed opportunities for this use helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	32e
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. We have hiked this area extensively and our alignment would make for a much better trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of FBO's proposed placement of lower brookbank	32f
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	32g
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	I support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action! There is some great stuff in this proposal.	New Trail Construction		General support of new trail construction	32h
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with way-finding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		General support Environmental study area	32i
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	I support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		general support of realigning trails	32j
Colin Beach		11/29/2013	Email	And I support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		General support of special use events	32k
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	. I am greatly concerned that the Proposed Action described in the Mt. Elden / Dry Lake Hills Recreation Planning Project will further decrease my local hiking experience.	Other		Generaly agaisnt MEDL	33a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	Map 1 – Sunset/Shultz Trailhead (TH) Consolidation These trailheads serve two different purposes, and although nearby, would add mileage to hiking the Weatherford Trail if they were consolidated and the Shultz TH removed. Mileage matters for hikers and likely runners. The Shultz TH exists, has a reasonable amount of parking and has a restroom. Why remove this and start all over a quarter mile down the road? I don't believe making the Sunset TH parking area the only TH will keep folks away from Shultz Tank and contributing to the sedimentation concerns there expressed in the Proposed Actions. I recommend leaving these trailheads as they are.	Trailhead Improvements		against schultz trailhead consolidation	33b
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	Map 2 – Equestrian Emphasis Area, Little Elden Trail Reroute If I understand this correctly, the Proposed Action wants to again limit my experience as a hiker and effectively lengthen the Little Elden Trail by removing nearby trailhead parking. The TH parking is adequate, why decommission and spend the time and money to build a new one? If the equestrian community has expresses a need for a new trailhead for their purposes, the additional parking near HWY 89 may be suitable, but removing what already exists along FR 556 is not necessary and its absence will be noticed. I often use the trailhead at Little Elden to visit the spring, to walk to the Little Bear trailhead (which lacks its own parking area) and to make a long walk over to Shultz Tank and back. Please do not remove this parking area and further diminish my hiking experience.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		against little elden reroute	33c
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	The proposed realignment of the Brookbank trail not only utilizes parts of an unauthorized trail, it also runs up a drainage which doesn't make sense for sustainability. Most importantly, by decommissioning the current trail and building one that is much longer, a short, easy route to the DLH no longer exists for hikers. This is a popular trail for a reason – sometimes people just want to get to the tank to see if there is water in it, take a short hike or introduce visiting friends to a beautiful area that is a relatively manageable hike for those not use to the elevation. The new trail alignment takes this all away.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		against brookbank relocation	33d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	Why realign the Upper Oldham trail only to have the downhill bike trails (shown in Map 5) use the lower portion of the Upper Oldham? A FS employee told me the problem with the Upper Oldham trail was damage due to erosion, but the lower end has its share of erosion which will only be accentuated by the gravity riders. I also wonder why the south section of Oldham Park at the top of the trail needs to have a section of trail running through it. It is true the current section of trail on the north side of the park is deeply rutted, but fixing this and maintaining it should be the goal, not impact to a new area. I am also concerned the parking area for Upper Oldham will disappear since the intent is to build a bigger parking area down the road. I hope this is not the case as a quick hike up the Upper Oldham trail is a favorite and adding to its length by moving the parking area would detract from the experience.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Against realigning upper oldham trail	33e
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	I am very concerned about the proposed DLH loop. This is an area that sees less traffic than others and offers the solitude many hikers seek out when they utilize the area. I look forward to the frogs, ducks and other wildlife that occupy this wetland area after a wet winter and worry their environment will be impacted by the additional crowds this location would get with a loop trail. Please, leave this area alone.	New Trail Construction		Against Dry lakes hill loop	33f
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	Map 4 – West Elden TH, Climbing Area Access It's difficult to tell from the map, but my main concern is the number of trees that may be removed to accommodate this new parking area. I agree the area gets some use and could use a restroom facility, particularly if human waste has been an issue, but the size of the parking area seems unnecessarily large for the number of vehicles I regularly see parked there. Providing climbers with officially maintained trails to ascend/descend the upper parts of the climbing area is a good idea and would minimize the impact the area is no doubt seeing. I suspect what is really behind enlarging this area is the proposed realignment of the Brookbank Trail which I do not support at all, so in light of the current use at this particular location, improvements to a smaller parking area would suffice.	Trailhead Improvements		Against West elden trailhead	33g

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	. The FS needs to consider how much additional traffic downhill bike trails will bring to this relatively quiet area. There is already a high volume of gravity riders being shuttled to the top of Elden Lookout Road who use unauthorized trails as well as Upper Oldham Trail (making for a dangerous hiking experience) for their thrill rides, impacting slopes, wildlife and hikers. Why condone this activity by giving this group free reign of the north side of Mt. Elden? Mt. Elden is no place for this sort of activity. Ski areas in other mountain towns offer services to gravity riders, perhaps Snowbowl would be interested in profiting off of this intrusive activity.	New Trail Construction		against downhill trails	33h
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	I think the new trail on the south face of Mt. Elden is not likely to receive as much use as the proposal suggests. This is a long trail that would be enjoyable during a small window of time due to its south facing nature. FS employees are suggesting bikers would not likely utilize this trail if built, but I find this extremely doubtful as I have walked some of the more extreme unauthorized downhill bike trails whose steepness is no match for this proposed trail. If this trail were built, it should be designated hiking only. This only seems fair as the FS is providing the biking community with biking only trails. Honestly, if this trail were built I would probably walk it at least once, but not likely more than that – it's on the hottest side of the mountain	New Trail Construction		against south face elden trail	33i
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	I'm not sure I understand the need to "harden" the surface near the base of Mt. Elden along the Flagstaff Loop Trail and Lower Oldham Trail. The Loop Trail was an effort coordinated by the Flagstaff Biking Organization and this Proposed Action to harden and smooth this portion of the Loop Trail will turn this area into a biking highway. It is hard to not look at this proposal and not see how FBO/biking community input is not being favored over that of other groups.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		against Flagstaff loop trail	33j
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	Map 7 – Mt. Elden ESA I leave nearby this area and use it frequently and often wonder about the historical aspect of the area. Sites of interest could use improved signage and new signs increasing visitor knowledge of the area is a good idea. I don't have any major objections to this Proposed Action.	Trailhead Improvements		Support of increased signage	33k

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	Mt. Elden TH Enlargement. I recommend the FS expand first in the direction of Hwy 89 and evaluate if that sufficiently satisfies the need for more parking before expanding to the west and removing trees for more parking. In fact, if more space were needed after expanding into the area closer to Hwy 89, I would recommend moving into the area south of this if necessary before removing trees to the west to accommodate.	Trailhead Improvements		mt. elden trailhead parking lot	33l
Lynn Weller		11/28/2013	Email	<p>I am concerned the Mt. Elden/Dry Lake Hills Recreation Planning Project Proposed Actions will</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • increase the length of a number of trails through realignment/decommissioning, thereby reducing the number of short, direct hikes to the top of Mt. Elden and DLH, limiting some hikers experiences • increase user traffic in areas where impact is relatively low, reducing the solitude and quiet sought out by some and impacting wildlife sightings • increase erosion by condoning the presence of downhill biking • increase vehicular traffic and dust levels on Mt. Elden Road by condoning the presence of downhill biking and the car shuttling that group often utilizes • unnecessarily remove trees to increase the size of parking areas • unnecessarily modify the landscape to create new trails - the focus should be on better maintaining existing trails • encourage illegal trail building as a number of currently unauthorized trails (or parts thereof) are included in the current plan • conflict and/or be influenced by logging operations in ways not yet know – perhaps aspects of this plan should be put on hold until that impact is better understood • favor the input of the biking community over others due to heavy lobbying by FBO 	Other		general complaints agaisnt MEDL	33m
kurt bankord		11/28/2013	Email	I reviewed the Mt. Elden Dry Lake Hills Recreation Planning Scoping and think you did a good job of trying to accomodate a diverse group of interests and also presere the area.	Other		general support	34
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	I think it makes sense for the Forest Service to adopt several non-system trails, specifically Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger, to improve connectivity of existing and proposed trails. In addition, adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger would provide more recreational opportunities for varied skill levels of hikers, bikers, equestrian, etc.	New Trail Construction		Support of including social trails	35a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	It would make sense to see a new trail that begins roughly from the current Schultz Creek/Rocky Ridge Trailhead and ascending the South face of the Dry Lake Hills in the area of the current trail Lost Burrito. A sustainable trail that switchbacked up the South face and merged into the proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop would provide an additional route choice to the top of Dry Lake Hills which would relieve user volume from Schultz Creek, Little Gnarly, Rocky Ridge and Brookbank. This new trail would provide a different user experience compared to Shultz Creek and Brookbank in that it would be on the South facing slope which would allow shoulder season access before the snow melts on Schultz Creek and Brookbank. Additionally, this trail would be easily accessed from town.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	35b
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	It would make sense to relocate the Schultz Creek Trailhead down to the Y at Schultz Pass Rd and Elden Lookout Rd. This change would allow 4-season access to the highly used trails of Rocky Ridge and Schultz Creek.	Trailhead Improvements		support of moving schultz creek trailhead to the Y	35c
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	The proposal to create Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail along the base of Mt Elden is outstanding. I propose leaving Forces of Nature and the trails that connect from the pipeline east to Elden Lookout Trail as they are now. I propose adding the Class 4 trail below (south) of the existing trails in that area. It would make sense to locate the Class 4 trail in between the current trails such as Forces of Nature and the Pipeline. This would allow multiple user experiences in the same user corridor. The idea of adding Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail will allow user of all kinds and skill levels to enjoy that beautiful area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		general support of Flagstaff loop trail	35d
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	The proposed action of creating a Dry Lake Hills Loop is excellent. I propose expanding it to tie together a route that allows users to circumnavigate most, if not all the Dry Lake Hills Basin. This expanded loop would tie together rerouted Brookbank, Jedi, Little Gnarly, Upper Brookbank, Pickle, Ginger and the previously proposed trail that would ascend the South face of Dry Lake Hills and merge into the Dry Lake Hills Loop.	New Trail Construction		support of Dry lakes loop	35e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	I propose rerouting the Heart Trail so that it is both sustainable and usable by all user groups. This reroute would provide the same benefit that Little Bear provided by linking the Dry Lake Hills area to the Little Elden Springs Trail and Schultz Tank area. A sustainable Heart Trail would link the Christmas Tree/Sandy Seep/Fat Man's Loop area to the Dry Lake Hills area. This would provide the east Flagstaff area with more direct access to the Dry Lake Hills area which would relieve pressure from other access points and disperse user visits.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Proposed rerouting of heart trail	35f
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	I support the reroute of Upper Oldham as it is currently not sustainable or user friendly for all user groups. The adoption of Red Onion and Wasabi would dovetail well with this reroute.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of upper oldham reroute	35g
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	Recommendation to add a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		proposed FBO new trail	35h
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	Recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. We have hiked this area extensively and our alignment would make for a much better trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		realign lower brookbank	35i
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	Recommendation to add upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. Recommendation to add Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		support adding social trails to the system	35j
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	Recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	35k
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	Recommendation to align the re-designated Class 4 Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area (the current FLT alignment). This will minimize impacts to the ESA and is a more appropriate placement for this trail type at the Forest- Community interface	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail recommendation	35l
Jerome Naleski		11/27/2013	Email	The Doney Park Multi-modal study completed in 2011 recommends a FUTS type extension from the end of the FUTS at Snowflake, across Forest Service land to the intersection of Townsend-Winona Road. The analysis for this folds perfectly into the MEDL planning.	New Trail Construction		Add a FUTS trail snowflake	35m

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	I'm really happy that you included all of the dh trails we originally gps'd. This is a well thought out system that even though is contained in a small area it can appeal to all levels of riders including first timers, family's, and of course the experts. I hope there will be a large corridor established around proposed trails so we can create much needed go around routes, braids, and bypasses.	New Trail Construction		Support of proposed downhill trails	36a
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	I also really like the proposed Dry Lakes Loops and the Turkey Park Loop. I think these trails will be a huge hit with all user groups and help with dispersing traffic and creating opportunities for linking together longer rides and walks.	New Trail Construction		support of Dry lakes loop and turkey park loop	36b
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	The proposed dh trail system is awesome but it may miss the mark for some of the mid and advanced level "all mountain" riders out there looking for a different experience than what the dh system provides. This is why we mapped the Lower bookbank Trail to reach back into the canyon that the current Lower Brookbank is in and then extending across the face of the DL area up to the scenic overlook. We believe the trail could follow this alignment without entering any owl pacs that may be in the area, it would have a beautiful contouring grade, and would be a classic multi use bench cut type trail. This would also give us an opportunity to create a well built descending "all mountain" trail where the trail Ginger is currently. Ginger and Jedi trails were two trails we included with our suggestions and would provide mountain bikers as well as hikers with a more challenging experience that is very much desired and needed as proven by the amount of social trails created in the Dry Lakes area.	New Trail Construction		Support of lower brookbank and including social trails	36c
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	Another trail we had suggested but was not included in the proposed action was a front side trail gps'd by Tomas that he was calling "Buck Rut" that would connect the current Shultz Trail and Rocky Ridge trail head with the Dry Lakes. There is already a user created trail leaving from this area connecting up to the Lost Burrito social trail which leads to the Dry Lakes. This could replace Lost Burrito and the steep Jedi trail also called Shepherder that drops off of the Dry Lakes down to the Shultz Creek trail.	New Trail Construction		Proposed trail "buck rut"	36d
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	From the Shultz Pass area trail head Little Gnarly is the only recognized route up to the Dry Lakes, Little Gnarly is a wide and steep double track jeep road, a single track alternative would be widely appreciated by all user groups.	New Trail Construction		Include little gnarly trail	36e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	Anthony has suggested a route from Sunset to the top of Lower Brookbank, this would greatly enhance the experience for all user groups and add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		proposed trail from sunset to lower brookbank	36f
Joshua Langdon		11/27/2013	Email	The proposed reroute for Upper Oldham is another excellent improvement for the trail system. This will help eliminate conflict issues with car traffic and mountain bikers on Lookout Road. A vital connection in the same area that was not included on this initial proposal is the Red Onion Trail. I believe this trail has been in use for twenty plus years and is very popular. It gives trail users a more direct approach to the Little Bear, Upper Brookbank, and Sunset Trails from the Lookout Road/Mount Elden trail system. Upper Oldham would be a fantastic connector to the upper reaches of Sunset Trail but descending the "Catwalk" into the "Hobbit Forrest" is a more advanced section of trail and may not appeal to more xc orientated riders as well as beginner and intermediate riders or any trail user looking for a shorter alternative then Upper Oldham and this why it was probably created in the first place. I can't emphasize enough how vital this connection is. The current Red Onion Trail, Upper and Lower, is poorly aligned, it is highly erosive and unappealing aesthetically. Having Red Onion cross the Road to a new Lower Red Onion then connecting to Upper Oldham would also help eliminate the conflict problems on Lookout Road, create better connectivity and establish a desired stacked loop system.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of upper oldhamd reroute and how the inclusion of red onion trail supports the reroute	36g
Martin Ince	City of Flagstaff and Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization	11/27/2013	Email	There is one additional forest access point from the end of Hollygreen Road on the north side of the Christmas Tree neighborhood that also abuts the National Forest, but is outside the limits of Map 7. 2 There is a vacant lot at the end of Hemburg Drive that is privately owned but is used for informal access to the forest. This access point is shown as "unofficial" on Map 7. City staff has had discussions in the past about securing an easement across the lot to formalize the access to the forest. For this study it is recommended that it be included as a future access point, so if the City is able to obtain an easement, then a formal trail connection can be made on Forest Service land.	Other		Additional forest access points	37a
Martin Ince		11/27/2013	Email	Where there are existing points of access, there are also one or more social trails that generally lead to Forest Service system trails. Will these trails be converted to formal system trails, and will other duplicate and unnecessary access trails be closed or obliterated?	New Trail Construction		Question about social trail inclusion	37b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Martin Ince		11/27/2013	Email	An existing City FUTS trail ends at the intersection of Marketplace Drive and the access road to the Flagstaff Ranger District. Our trails master plan shows this trail extending northwest and connecting to the Pipeline Trail, but given the location and function, this trail extension could be a Class 4 Forest Service trail rather than a formal FUTS trail.	New Trail Construction		new trail ideas	37c
Martin Ince		11/27/2013	Email	<p>The plan for a Class 4 trail along the base of Mt Elden is a good idea; the existing Pipeline Trail is already is well-used, and a new Class 4 trail would be a good complement to the FUTS system in the area as a trail that can be used for both recreation and transportation. However, for this trail to function best for recreation and transportation, it is recommended that some changes to the proposed trail be considered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -At the west end, a new Class 4 trail has already been proposed as part of the Flagstaff Loop Trail to realign the trail from the pipeline. - In the middle section, the trail should generally follow the alignment of the Pipeline Trail rather than the Forces of Nature, A Walk Through Time, Spring, and Wildlife Tree Trails through the Environmental Study Area. -Toward the east end, the trail could tie into the intersection of El Paso Drive and Mountain Meadow Drive, and then extend north. There is a "pinch point" a little further north where the existing Pipeline Trail is only about 50 feet from a private parcel at its nearest point. For this short section, the new Class 4 trail may have to share the alignment with the existing Pipeline Trail. -After the pinch point, the Class 4 trail can be aligned to the east of the Pipeline Trail through the flats in the area generally bounded by the Pipeline Trail, the old Christensen School, and the Flagstaff Ranger District. In this vicinity, a Class 4 trail connection can also be made to the existing FUTS that ends at the intersection of Marketplace Drive and the Flagstaff Ranger District access road (described above in comment 4). 	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail recommendations	37d
Martin Ince			Email	As part of the proposed Mt Elden trailhead enlargement, some consideration should be given to extending the Elden Lookout Trail east to make a direct connection to the City's North 89 FUTS Trail. Although hikers and bicyclists can make this connection now through the parking lot, the parking lot is going to be enlarged and will have more vehicular activity. A direct connection supports the concept of using FUTS to walk or bike to access Forest Service trails, rather than driving to the trailhead.	Trailhead Improvements		mt. elden trailhead improvement ideas	37e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Martin Ince		11/27/2013	Email	<p>Coconino County's Doney Park Multimodal Transportation Study includes plans for 2 shared use pathways that appear to cross Forest Service land and are within the boundaries of the Mt Elden/Dry Lake Hills planning area.</p> <p>- The first is a proposed pathway that connects from the end of the FUTS trail at Snowflake and Highway 89 to the intersection of Townsend-Winona Road and Highway 89. This proposed trail is aligned through the National Forest to the west of the triangle of private land and the Elden Pueblo Archeology Site. This trail is an important link between planned pathways in Doney Park and the City's FUTS system.</p> <p>- The second is a planned pathway along the west side of Highway 89, generally between Townsend-Winona Road and Forest Road 743. It is possible that this planned trail could remain within the right-of-way of Highway 89, however if it is necessary for the trail to be aligned outside of the right-of-way it would be on Forest Service land for some sections.</p>	Other		suggest ideas on including doney park	37f
Martin Ince		11/27/2013	Email	<p>The City Council recently concluded a public process to help determine future use of 17 City-owned vacant parcels. For the 20-acre parcel near the intersection of Schultz Pass Road and Elden Lookout Road, Council's direction was to keep the parcel as open space, with the possibility of a future trailhead that would serve as a trail hub between FUTS trails to the south and Forest Service trails to the north. A separate letter has been submitted by the City's Assistant to the City Manager for Real Estate indicating the City's interest in future discussions with the Forest Service regarding a USFS-managed trailhead on the parcel.</p>	Other		New trail head proposal on city land	37g
Judy Tincher	Coconino Rural Environment Corps	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Coconino Rural Environment Corps (CREC) fully supports the Mount Elden/Dry Lake Hills project. CREC is committed to stewardship, and in the spirit of service, we take pride in working hard to care for the environment. The MEDL project will require a lot of work, and CREC hopes to provide a workforce of local youth and young adults to get the job done.</p>	Other		general support of MEDL	38a
Judy Tincher		11/26/2013	Email	<p>I think improved signage, improved trailheads, 23 miles of new trail and relocating and decommissioning some eroded trails is a good move. It's also great that the plan takes into consideration so many user groups including downhill mountain bikers, equestrians and hang gliders.</p>	Other		General support	38b
James Duval		11/26/2013	Email	<p>One trail that is of significant importance to me is the Red Onion connector trail. I would like to see this trail upgraded to Forest Service standards and kept in the system. I would also like to see some of the downhill users specific trails kept in the system and perhaps have a variety of one way only down hill intermediate to expert terrain developed.</p>	New Trail Construction		support of red onion and downhill trails	39a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
James Duval		11/26/2013	Email	I would like to specifically support the recommendations as posted on the Flagstaff Biking Organizations website	Other		Support of FBO's Proposed Plan	39b
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	The public comment period needs to be extended by several months. Although you present no data whatsoever on any of your proposed actions or the effects of these proposed actions, this long-awaited forest plan is very important with complex details the public needs time to consider. A one month public comment period is unrealistic. If it took CNF several years to finally publish your plan, it is most reasonable for the purpose of the EA process to allow the public at least a few more months to comment.	Other		Public ocmment period was too short	40a
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	There are serious concerns about the ability of the Coconino National Forest and Brian Poturalski to be objective in this planning project. Brian Poturalski and the CNF appear to have a conflict of interest due to their long-term alliance / MOU (Memorandum of Understanding) with a Flagstaff special interest group: Flagstaff Biking Organization (FBO).	Other		concern over fairness with community groups	40b
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	This project needs larger oversight, e.g. regional and national USFS agencies supervision and credible conservation group scrutiny. It appears that CNF management is biased in favor of specific projects requested by FBO that are environmentally destructive, unsafe, offensive to other recreationists, and wholly against the USFS-CNF stated management and MEDL planning purpose.	Other		General concern	40c
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	Remove the proposed "Downhill Mountain Biking" Trails (MEDL Proposed Planning Project, under "New Trail Construction", pg 3). Remove the source of increased motorized traffic on Mt Elden Road caused by Downhill/Gravity Riders. Obliterate the existing illegal downhill trails – and enforce it.	New Trail Construction		against downhill trails	40d
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	DO YOUR OWN TRAIL WORK and remove the perception that special interest groups can buy favor with the USFS by doing "volunteer trail work".	Other		concern over how the trail work will be completed	40e
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	Remove the "ELDEN SCENIC TRAILHEAD" and "SCENIC LOOP TRAIL" on top of Mt. Elden from your proposed plan. These two actions will turn Mt Elden into a circus of motorized supported activities. Once again, this will only increase motorized activity. These two proposals appear more to promote shuttle vehicle access and Gravity Rider access for the proposed downhill trails (and other existing downhill trails) in the immediate area than for any "scenic" viewers or loop hikers.	Trailhead Improvements		Against elden scenic trailhead and scenic loop	40f

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	Close the existing gate at the base of Mt Elden Road to prevent abuse of Mt Elden slopes and Mt Elden road through Gravity Riding repeated shuttles.	Trailhead Improvements		suggested gate use	40g
Emma Lou Benanti		11/25/2013	Email	Remove the HANG GLIDER LAUNCH SITE construction. How large is the demand for hang glider recreation relative to the all the recreationists on Mt Elden? Resurfacing the top of Mt Elden and 5 acres of tree removal is extreme and not a fair representation of the community of Mt Elden area recreationists. Once again, Mt Elden doesn't need additional parking lots and increased motorized vehicle activity at the top. The high elevation area of Mt Elden is a special and fragile environment. This is excessive, additional expense and environmental damage.	Hang Glider Launch Site		Agaisnt hang glider launch site	40h
Evan Sollberger		11/25/2013	Email	Recommendation to add upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. Recommendation to add a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. Recommendation to add Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank	New Trail Construction		Proposed inclusion of social trails	41a
Evan Sollberger		11/25/2013	Email	Recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed realignment to the east	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Relocation of Brookbank Trail	42b
Evan Sollberger		11/25/2013	Email	Recommendation to add a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		New trail idea	42c
Evan Sollberger		11/25/2013	Email	Recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		New trail idea	42d
Ken Bennett		11/25/2013	Email	Recommend relocating the Schultz Creek trailhead to the "Y" and ask the Forest Service to manage this area.	Trailhead Improvements		schultz creek trailhead relocation	43a
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	Recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area. Recommend adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	43b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	Recommend addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills. Recommend maximum utilization of terrain for Downhill trails, preferably with a progressive difficulty level.	New Trail Construction		Schultz creek trail connector with dry lakes loop	43c
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	Recommend adding Ginger and Jedi to the trail network (2 of my favorite trails) Recommend adding a connector trail from lower Sunset to the top portion of Lower Brookbank	New Trail Construction		New trail ideas	43d
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	Recommend moving Lower Brookbank from it's currently proposed Re-Alignment to the East	Trail Relocation and Improvement		lower brookbank reroute	43e
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	Recommend better interpretive facilities and signage for ease of way finding and better education opportunities for users.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of increased signage	43f
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	Recommend Forest Service consider realigning existing system trails that are poorly aligned to better address erosion issues and user experience as outlined in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of trail improvments	43g
Ken Bennett		11/25/201	Email	I also support the use of the trail system for appropriately sanctioned events such as bike or foot races	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special sue events	43h
Andrew Berman		11/25/2013	Email	One trail that has provided welcome relief from the high speed mechanized world is known by a dedicated group of older hikers as the Lost Burrito Trail (aka to some as the Sheep Herder's trail), but unfortunately, it is one of the unofficial trails that I fear could be eliminated. Loss of the Lost Burrito would pretty much eliminate the Dry Lake Hills for hikers that do not want to have to worry about getting run over.I would now advocate for including the Lost Burrito Trail as an official part of the MEDL if its use could be limited to hikers only.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Keep Lost Burrito Trail	44
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support increasing the number of permits allowed for special events such as bike and running races, including "enduro" type timed downhill races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special sue events	45a
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support creating a permanent parking area with a toilet at the Schultz Creek Y that will allow 4 season access, and would like to see a small "bike skills" park there. I would like tosee the FS work with the City of Flagstaff on this one, creating a permanent open space area there.	Trailhead Improvements		Trailhead at the Y	45b
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I would like to see the Flagstaff Loop Trail contour in the pipeline corridor rather than the through the Forces of Nature/Environmental Study area on the south side of Mt. Elden.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	45c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I would like to have upper Red Onion trail added to the system. It is an important connector that decreases the need to ride up the road. With additional road traffic stemming from increasing downhill trail shuttling I think it will become even more important as a connector.	New Trail Construction		Support of including red onion trail	45d
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support a new connector from Schultz Creek trailhead to the Dry Lakes Loop in order to maximize the "stacked loops" concept and disperse use on the trails. I support a connector from Lower Sunset to Lower Brookbank, again adding more options and versatility to the system.	New Trail Construction		New trail ideas	45e
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support downhill/shuttled access trails that can be legally maintained (decreased environmental impact). Having designated downhill trails will decrease user conflict and introduces new riders to the sport.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	45f
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommended alignment for lower Brookbank trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Fbo's plan for lower brookbank	45g
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support adding Ginger and Jedi trails to the system. They are great advanced/intermediate trails for those that don't want to commit to the full downhill experience but still want a very challenging ride. They are also additional options from dropping down from the top of Dry Lake Hills, aiding in the dispersal of trail use helping to decrease user conflicts.	New Trail Construction		Inclusion of giner and jedi trails	45h
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support the improvements to the Mt Elden ESA. Interpretive trails are fun and great for locals and out of towners alike. Increasing education of our natural areas increases environmental stewardship.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of the environmental study area	45i
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support formalizing the climbing area on Mt. Elden.	New Trail Construction		Support of West Elden Climbing Access	45j
Erik Borling		11/24/2013	Email	I support the class 4 trail development from Elden Lookout Trail to Elden Lookout Road and especially the connector to Buffalo Park. This will allow quicker access to the forest from various parts of town, will assist bicycle commuters, and will allow a mud/rut free way to access the FS trails during the muddy parts of the year. The trails on the mountains drain well but the area behind Buffalo park is sticky mud and would benefit from a raised grade trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of Class 4 trail development	45k
David Blanchard		11/28/2013	Email	The re-route of Lower Brookbank, for example, is nowhere near the current alignment and might be considered a "new" trail. Flagstaff Biking Organization (FBO) has proposed a different realignment of Lower Brookbank and I support their proposal to move Lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		supports FBO's proposed reroute of lower brookbank	46a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
David Blanchard		11/28/2013	Email	The Recreation Plan should consider relocating the Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz Y" City Parcel to provide a 4-season accessible trail head. Moving the trailhead would require an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff. Given the recent public support to preserve this land because of its access to trails this action should be sought.	Trailhead Improvements		support of moving the schultz creek trailhead to the Y	46b
David Blanchard		11/28/2013	Email	The current plan does not retain the Ginger and Jedi Trails. These trails are intermediate/expert in difficulty and there are many riders looking for this kind of challenge. Consequently, I suggest that these two trails be a part of the Recreation Plan. The plan also eliminates Red Onion Trail. This trail is a useful connector when traveling up Elden Lookout Road to easily access Little Bear, Sunset, and Upper Brookbank without having to travel to the top of the road.	New Trail Construction		support of including social trails	46c
David Blanchard		11/28/2013	Email	The proposal plan should also include opportunities for downhill (DH) riders. I am not a DH'er but recognize that this is a growing segment of the mountain biking community. Providing adequate trails and access for the DH community may have the added benefit of moving many of these riders off of other system trails and reducing user conflicts.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	46d
David Blanchard		11/28/2013	Email	FBO has also suggested a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank Trail. I believe this would supplement or replace the current access via Little Gnarly -- an interesting but ultimately unsustainable trail owing to its steep gradient in places.	New Trail Construction		against FBO's connector trail	46c
David Blanchard		11/28/2013	Email	There is a spur trail from Upper Brookbank that drops steeply down into the Dry Lakes area. This spur is used by Northern Arizona Trail Runners Association (NATRA) Soulstice Trail Run each fall so that they do not travel across a non-USFS section of Upper Brookbank. This segment is unsustainable and should be replaced with a trail that accommodates the steep terrain.	New Trail Construction		unsuitable trail in current conditions	46d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	It makes sense for the Forest Service to adopt several non-system trails, specifically Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger, to improve connectivity of existing and proposed trails. In addition, adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger would provide more recreational opportunities for varied skill levels of hikers, bikers, equestrian, etc. When adopting these non-system trails the Arizona Trail from Schultz Tank to Lower Moto provides a good model. When social trails in that area were adopted they were incorporated where and when they met topographical and sustainability requirements. I propose the same approach when adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger. Wasabi could serve as part of the Downhill Specific trail expansion.	New Trail Construction		include social trails	47a
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	It would make sense to see a new trail that begins roughly from the current Schultz Creek/Rocky Ridge Trailhead and ascending the South face of the Dry Lake Hills in the area of the current trail Lost Burrito. A sustainable trail that switchbacked up the South face and merged into the proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop would provide an additional route choice to the top of Dry Lake Hills which would relieve user volume from Schultz Creek, Little Gnarly, Rocky Ridge and Brookbank. This new trail would provide a different user experience compared to Schultz Creek and Brookbank in that it would be on the South facing slope which would allow shoulder season access before the snow melts on Schultz Creek and Brookbank. Additionally, this trail would be easily accessed from town.	New Trail Construction		proposed new trail	47b
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	It would make sense to relocate the Schultz Creek Trailhead down to the Y at Schultz Pass Rd and Elden Lookout Rd. This change would allow 4-season access to the highly used trails of Rocky Ridge and Schultz Creek.	Trailhead Improvements		support of moving schultz creek trailhead to the Y	47c
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	The proposal to create Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail along the base of Mt Elden is outstanding. I propose leaving Forces of Nature and the trails that connect from the pipeline east to Elden Lookout Trail as they are now. I propose adding the Class 4 trail below (south) of the existing trails in that area. It would make sense to locate the Class 4 trail in between the current trails such as Forces of Nature and the Pipeline. This would allow multiple user experiences in the same user corridor. The idea of adding Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail will allow user of all kinds and skill levels to enjoy that beautiful area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of Class 4 trail development	47d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	The proposed action of creating a Dry Lake Hills Loop is excellent. I propose expanding it to tie together a route that allows users to circumnavigate most, if not all the Dry Lake Hills Basin. This expanded loop would tie together rerouted Brookbank, Jedi, Little Gnarly, Upper Brookbank, Pickle, Ginger and the previously proposed trail that would ascend the South face of Dry Lake Hills and merge into the Dry Lake Hills Loop. This would provide extensive user options from the Dry Lake Hills area for all skill levels and a wide variety of users.	New Trail Construction		support of dry lakes loop	47d
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	I propose rerouting the Heart Trail so that it is both sustainable and usable by all user groups. This reroute would provide the same benefit that Little Bear provided by linking the Dry lake Hills area to the Little Elden Springs Trail and Schultz Tank area. A sustainable Heart Trail would link the Christmas Tree/Sandy Seep/Fat Man's Loop area to the Dry Lake Hills area. This would provide the east Flagstaff area with more direct access to the Dry Lake Hills area which would relieve pressure from other access points and disperse user visits.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		reroute heart trail	47e
Eliza Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	I support the reroute of Upper Oldham as it is currently not sustainable or user friendly for all user groups. The adoption of Red Onion and Wasabi would dovetail well with this reroute.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		reroute upper oldham	47f
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	I think it makes sense for the Forest Service to adopt several non-system trails, specifically Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger, to improve connectivity of existing and proposed trails. In addition, adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger would provide more recreational opportunities for varied skill levels of hikers, bikers, equestrian, etc. When adopting these non-system trails the Arizona Trail from Schultz Tank to Lower Moto provides a good model. When social trails in that area were adopted they were incorporated where and when they met topographical and sustainability requirements. I propose the same approach when adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger. Wasabi could serve as part of the Downhill Specific trail expansion.	New Trail Construction		adoption of social trails into the system	48a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	It would make sense to see a new trail that begins roughly from the current Schultz Creek/Rocky Ridge Trailhead and ascending the South face of the Dry Lake Hills in the area of the current trail Lost Burrito. A sustainable trail that switchbacked up the South face and merged into the proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop would provide an additional route choice to the top of Dry Lake Hills which would relieve user volume from Schultz Creek, Little Gnarly, Rocky Ridge and Brookbank. This new trail would provide a different user experience compared to Shultz Creek and Brookbank in that it would be on the South facing slope which would allow shoulder season access before the snow melts on Schultz Creek and Brookbank. Additionally, this trail would be easily accessed from town.	New Trail Construction		new trial idea	48b
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	It would make sense to relocate the Schultz Creek Trailhead down to the Y at Schultz Pass Rd and Elden Lookout Rd. This change would allow 4-season access to the highly used trails of Rocky Ridge and Schultz Creek.	Trailhead Improvements		Move schultz creek trailhead to the Y	48c
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	The proposal to create Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail along the base of Mt Elden is outstanding. I propose leaving Forces of Nature and the trails that connect from the pipeline east to Elden Lookout Trail as they are now. I propose adding the Class 4 trail below (south) of the existing trails in that area. It would make sense to locate the Class 4 trail in between the current trails such as Forces of Nature and the Pipeline. This would allow multiple user experiences in the same user corridor. The idea of adding Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail will allow user of all kinds and skill levels to enjoy that beautiful area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of Class 4 trail development and keeping forces of nature	48d
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	The proposed action of creating a Dry Lake Hills Loop is excellent. I propose expanding it to tie together a route that allows users to circumnavigate most, if not all the Dry Lake Hills Basin. This expanded loop would tie together rerouted Brookbank, Jedi, Little Gnarly, Upper Brookbank, Pickle, Ginger and the previously proposed trail that would ascend the South face of Dry Lake Hills and merge into the Dry Lake Hills Loop. This would provide extensive user options from the Dry Lake Hills area for all skill levels and a wide variety of users.	New Trail Construction		support of dry lakes loop	48e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	I propose rerouting the Heart Trail so that it is both sustainable and usable by all user groups. This reroute would provide the same benefit that Little Bear provided by linking the Dry Lake Hills area to the Little Elden Springs Trail and Schultz Tank area. A sustainable Heart Trail would link the Christmas Tree/Sandy Seep/Fat Man's Loop area to the Dry Lake Hills area. This would provide the east Flagstaff area with more direct access to the Dry Lake Hills area which would relieve pressure from other access points and disperse user visits.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of relocating the heart trail	48f
Kip Moyer		11/23/2013	Email	I support the reroute of Upper Oldham as it is currently not sustainable or user friendly for all user groups. The adoption of Red Onion and Wasabi would dovetail well with this reroute.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouting upper oldham	48g
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	I think it makes sense for the Forest Service to adopt several non-system trails, specifically Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger, to improve connectivity of existing and proposed trails. In addition, adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger would provide more recreational opportunities for varied skill levels of hikers, bikers, equestrian, etc. When adopting these non-system trails the Arizona Trail from Schultz Tank to Lower Moto provides a good model. When social trails in that area were adopted they were incorporated where and when they met topographical and sustainability requirements. I propose the same approach when adopting Jedi, Red Onion, Wasabi, Pickle and Ginger. Wasabi could serve as part of the Downhill Specific trail expansion.	New Trail Construction		Support of including social trails	49a
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	It would make sense to see a new trail that begins roughly from the current Schultz Creek/Rocky Ridge Trailhead and ascending the South face of the Dry Lake Hills in the area of the current trail Lost Burrito. A sustainable trail that switchbacked up the South face and merged into the proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop would provide an additional route choice to the top of Dry Lake Hills which would relieve user volume from Schultz Creek, Little Gnarly, Rocky Ridge and Brookbank. This new trail would provide a different user experience compared to Schultz Creek and Brookbank in that it would be on the South facing slope which would allow shoulder season access before the snow melts on Schultz Creek and Brookbank. Additionally, this trail would be easily accessed from town	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	49b
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	It would make sense to relocate the Schultz Creek Trailhead down to the Y at Schultz Pass Rd and Elden Lookout Rd. This change would allow 4-season access to the highly used trails of Rocky Ridge and Schultz Creek.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of moving schultz creek trailhead to the Y	49c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	The proposal to create Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail along the base of Mt Elden is outstanding. I propose leaving Forces of Nature and the trails that connect from the pipeline east to Elden Lookout Trail as they are now. I propose adding the Class 4 trail below (south) of the existing trails in that area. It would make sense to locate the Class 4 trail in between the current trails such as Forces of Nature and the Pipeline. This would allow multiple user experiences in the same user corridor. The idea of adding Class 4 trail to the Loop Trail will allow user of all kinds and skill levels to enjoy that beautiful area.	New Trail Construction		Support of the class 4 trail and keeping forces of nature	49d
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	The proposed action of creating a Dry Lake Hills Loop is excellent. I propose expanding it to tie together a route that allows users to circumnavigate most, if not all the Dry Lake Hills Basin. This expanded loop would tie together rerouted Brookbank, Jedi, Little Gnarly, Upper Brookbank, Pickle, Ginger and the previously proposed trail that would ascend the South face of Dry Lake Hills and merge into the Dry Lake Hills Loop. This would provide extensive user options from the Dry Lake Hills area for all skill levels and a wide variety of users.	New Trail Construction		support of dry lakes loop	49e
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	I propose rerouting the Heart Trail so that it is both sustainable and usable by all user groups. This reroute would provide the same benefit that Little Bear provided by linking the Dry lake Hills area to the Little Elden Springs Trail and Schultz Tank area. A sustainable Heart Trail would link the Christmas Tree/Sandy Seep/Fat Man's Loop area to the Dry Lake Hills area. This would provide the east Flagstaff area with more direct access to the Dry Lake Hills area which would relieve pressure from other access points and disperse user visits.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of relocating the heart trail	49f
Gail hughes		11/22/2013	Email	I support the reroute of Upper Oldham as it is currently not sustainable or user friendly for all user groups. The adoption of Red Onion and Wasabi would dovetail well with this reroute	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouting upper olham trail	49g
Linda Sherman		11/21/2013	Email	The thing that is missing in your plan is any plan to deal with the large number of loose dogs that enter the trail system every day, putting pressure on wildlife and disrupting the enjoyment of the trails for others. It would be fine with me if dogs were restricted from the more sensitive areas. That way the amount of use would be reduced, erosion would be less of an issue with the mountain bikes off the trail, wildlife would be protected, and it would be a peaceful, quiet trail for hikers and runners. And maybe cost less than decommissioning the entire trail.	Other		concern over dogs in the area	50a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Linda Sherman		11/21/2013	Email	I think it is too bad that you will decommission some of the traditional, historic trails in the area. Couldn't these trails be reworked in the areas where erosion is a problem and not destroy the whole trail? Maybe some switchbacks and water bars in certain areas. If overuse is a problem, why not restrict these older trails to foot traffic only, since you are planning new trails for bikers, equestrians, climbers and hang gliders.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		don't decomission historic trails	50b
Linda Sherman		11/21/2013	Email	Also, there needs to be some monitoring of the drinking areas near the east end of the pipeline near Christensen School. Your proposed trail runs right through it. I had a crying, upset woman approach me there and ask meto call 911. She was apparently having difficulty with the man she was with. I think that it can be dangerous to enter that area, especially for a woman alone.	Other		Saftey Concern	50c
Jay Bowers		11/21/2013	Email	I am writing this in order to express my support of the work being considered for the Mount Elden Dry Lake Hills Recreation Area (as outlined on the Flagstaff Biking Organization's website http://flagstaffbiking.org/ . Anything that can be done to enhance the experience, safety & accessibility will be a worthy investment; seeing the area developed for a wide variety of skills, abilities and interests will be a worthy investment that will continue to pay off for generations to come	Other		Support of FBO's proposed plan	51
Kenneth Schipper		11/20/2013	Email	I think this is a fantastic project and I fully support it. It provides a great expansion of the legal non motorized trails while maintaining a responsible impact on the forrest and dispersing use. The only thing that would make this better is a trail or two that would be opened to motorized single track use. This should be toward the north side of the mountain to minimize user conflicts, if possible.	Other		general support	52
Chris Grove		11/20/2013	Email	An easier way from Buffalo Park to the forest N of the park. We used to ride the pipeline, then the current trail was built and was better, but has become unusable by all but the most experienced cyclists. We need a FUTS type trail that would give beginning riders access to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		need a trail from buffalo park to the forest	53a
Chris Grove		11/20/2013	Email	Realignment of some trails that are very eroded and just cannot be maintained. One that comes to mind is the section of Sunset in the "saddle" where the trail has become a rut. Lower Brookbank is another	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouting eroded trails	53b
Chris Grove		11/20/2013	Email	I would like to see the addition of "Red Onion" since it provides a great connector from Elden Road to many trails without having to climb all the way up Mt Elden Rd. I use this often when pressed for time and it provides great options for riders that are not fit.	New Trail Construction		Support of including red onion trail	53c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Chris Grove		11/20/2013	Email	I hope with the improved trail system, you will continue to work with the trail users for events such as races and other organized events to get users into the forest.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	53d
Joan Martini		11/20/2013	Email	I agree that MEDL's close proximity to town allows easy saturation of the area by recreational users but the proposed additional new trails will add to the problem of habitat fragmentation. What is the threshold for disturbing wildlife habitat vs. recreational usage?	Other		concern over habitat fragmentation	54a
Joan Martini		11/20/2013	Email	I agree that Brookbank and Upper Oldham need to be rerouted to meet class 3 specifications.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouteing upper oldhamn and brookbank	54b
Joan Martini		11/20/2013	Email	have a Forest Service crew or a dedicated experienced contract crew (with the supervision of a capable, knowledgeable and present crew foreman) in place to perform heavy trail maintenance during the summer monsoons. This would allow for maximum benefit due to moist, compactible soils. The crew would work 7 days/week from mid July to mid September exclusively on the MEDL trail system. 8 weeks (56 days) at approximately .75 miles per day equals 42 miles of trails maintained. This would be more cost and time effective and it would help to fulfill the F.S. mission of resource protection.	Other		Medl specific trail crew	54c
Joan Martini		11/20/2013	Email	Downhill trails will encourage more motorized use of Elden Lookout Road (a road designed and maintained for F.S. admin use and tower maintenance) for shuttling. A sensible solution would be to close and lock the gate on Elden LO Rd. Year round non-motorized recreational access would still be allowed with the benefit of a quieter, more peaceful experience for all. People that need motorized access to Elden LO Rd. could have keys. Recreational users that need a motorized experience can use snowmobiles all winter and help pack down the road for snow shoeing, x-country skiing, and snow bikes. Problems with littering, vandalism, high speed driving by downhill bike shuttlers (causing safety issues, dust, road deterioration) will be halted at no cost to the F.S.	Other		keep elden lookout road use limited	54d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joan Martini		11/20/2013	Email	Downhill trails are essentially experimental and have no history of long term longevity. Why not use limited funds and manpower to benefit all recreational users by maintaining/building class 3 multi-use trails? Move all downhill bike activity to the AZ Snowbowl. This would be consistent with the Ski Area Recreational Opportunity Enhancement Act of 2011 and would allow for a well-built high quality recreational experience as has been proven in many regions of the country. Use of limited funding/manpower to build downhill bike trails for very few users goes against F.S. mandate to sustain the People's Lands. The National Forests are not just a vast playground for adults. It is also home to wildlife, plants, timber, as well as headwaters for one-fifth of the Nation's freshwater	New Trail Construction		against downhill trails	54e
Joan Martini		11/20/2013	Email	Trash, litter, and human waste are an increasing concern at the high use trail heads. This is both an obvious health concern as well as a loss of aesthetic value on public land. I fully support using limited funding to install toilet facilities at all of the developed trail heads. Especially since many of the trail heads are within City of Flagstaff watersheds.	Trailhead Improvements		support of restrooms at trailheads	54f
Eric Smith		11/20/2013	Email	I support the creation and designation of user specific trails in the hopes that some of the characteristic damage associated with downhill bike use can be mitigated or at least contained.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	55a
Eric Smith		11/20/2013	Email	I also approve of the need to reroute both the Brookbank and Upper Oldham trails. Oldham in particular has sustained a great deal of damage on the uppermost section due to poor drainage of the Mt. Elden Lookout road above it. Finding a path which minimizes the ongoing deterioration would be most welcome.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouteing upper oldham and brookbank	55b
Eric Smith		11/20/2013	Email	I would like to suggest a change to the location of the seasonally locked gate on MT. Elden Lookout Road. I am a year-round user of the trails on the backside, and would like to continue to be able to access the trailheads for Brookbank and Upper Oldham in all seasons. The current situation essentially eliminates practical access to these trails. Moving the gate 2 miles north to the nexus of Oldham/Brookbank/Rocky Ridge would allow for winter enthusiasts like myself to reach trails that are ideal for creating loop hike options.	Other		move the Mt. Elden road gate location for increased winter use	55c
Kyle Hornbeck		11/20/2013	Email	I'm in favor of this proposed plan because it includes more infrastructure, smarter trail access, allows for more sustainable trails and will hopefully adopt some of the area's popular social trails - making them safer and incorporating them into more comprehensive "loop" system	Other		general support of MEDL	56a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Kyle Hornbeck		11/20/2013	Email	Specifically, I really like the Brookbank and Oldham trail re-routes, adopting "Red Onion" "Jedi" and "Ginger" into the system, re-locating the Shultz creek trailhead from the existing location to the more accessible city parcel at the junction of Elden Lookout and Shultz Pass roads. This trailhead relocation makes a lot of sense and will provide more adequate forest access as the Flagstaff metro area continues to grow. The Elden lookout trailhead expansion make perfect sense as well.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouting brookbank and upper oldham	56b
Jennifer Kolodinsky		11/20/2013	Email	I want to lend my support to the Flagstaff Biking Organization's position on planning for the Mount Elden Dry Lake Hills Recreation Planning Proposed Action.	Other		General support of FBO's proposed plan	57
Joan Martini		11/19/2013	Email	One of our main concerns is the Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop Trail. The trail loops around a rare alpine marshland that we found out could be an even rarer Wetland Cienega. Please preserve this area. It would be ideal if it could become a Protected Wildlife Quiet Area similar to other quiet areas on the Coconino National Forest. As observed over the past 39 years, if you build the loop trail, trails will sprout off of it and the area will be compromised. We need to preserve it for future generations. Once compromised it would be irreplaceable. The rim of the crater can be used as a natural boundary to protect this wetland cienega. A sign stating "You are entering a Protected Wildlife Quiet Area, non-motorized/non-mechanized area only" could be posted on the North edge of the rim.	New Trail Construction		Against Dry lakes hill loop	58
Joan Martini and Brad Baxter		11/19/2013	Email	Another concern is the distribution of hiking vs. mountain biking trails in the proposal. Some groups are proposing another mountain bike trail ("Buckrut") to become part of the MEDL System. This trail would be too steep to ride up so it would become a downhill only trail. The current route is not sustainable as a bike trail. It has lasted years with hikers using it. Please consider giving the hikers/runners a route on the Southwest side of Dry Lake Hills as part of the "quiet" area. A non-motorized/non-mechanized route similar to a wilderness trail but close to town. There is a sizable group of people that have minimal resource impact and need to have a place in nature without the user conflicts that occur on Schultz Creek Trail. An identified route (Lost Burrito- "Buckrut") would take minimal FS/volunteer time and resources to be maintainable. The hiking route already exists, it just needs to be protected from further downhill bike traffic.	New Trail Construction		support of maintaining hiking only trails	59

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jeff Strang		11/19/2013	Email	The proposed South Elden trail is closest to my neighborhood. I have long thought that there should be a trail going up Elden here. This planned trail nicely fits my desires. Please include this in the final proposal.	New Trail Construction		support of south elden trail	60a
Jeff Strang		11/19/2013	Email	I do think that this trail [south elden] will increase the use of the unofficial trailhead at the end of Paradise. While I do not think this access point should be a full Trailhead, I do think you should consider giving it a minor upgrade.	Trailhead Improvements		support of trailhead improvements	60b
Roy Lippman		11/18/2013	Email	I am in full support of improving the launch sites on Elden. The one that currently faces south is (ok), but could use some buffing out. We also need to improve the East facing launch site (clearing of snags and dead and down). But what I would most like to see is to create a SW facing launch on that ridge to the East of the current south launch. As we all know SW is more prevalent around here, and this would increase the fly-ability and safety of Elden. The other factor in all of this is the road condition. It seems to have improved over the past few years, but can be a real problem. I would hate to see money and time go into improving the launch, but have horrible access due to road conditions. This should be considered in part of the plan	Hang Glider Launch Site		Support of the hang glider launch site	61
Shane Stilwell	Dawn to Dust Race Team from Sierra Vista, AZ	11/18/2013	Email	Speaking for the club, I want to officially show our support for the Flagstaff Biking Organization and their initiatives for trails in the area.	Other		Support of FBO's proposed plan	62
Jeff Cocking		11/18/2013	Email	I support the closure of some the trails as long as some more trails will be constructed to ease congestion in the MEDL area for all outdoor enthusiasts.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		support of trail closures	63a
Jeff Cocking		11/18/2013	Email	I support FBO's stance on all planning issues pertaining to MEDL project.	Other		Support of FBO's proposed plan	63b
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	Specifically, I support the relocation of Schultz Creek Trailhead to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. I urge USFS to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trailhead.	Trailhead Improvements		support of relocating the shultz creek trailhead to the Y	64a
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	I recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden along the Pipeline corridor, rather than along Forces of Nature and other trails in the ESA. This makes logical sense and fits in better with the overall quality and difficulty of the Loop Trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Support of Flagstaff loop trail	64b
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	While not a downhill biker myself, I do believe that providing well-managed downhill trails helps minimize user conflicts, allowing the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained and minimizing environmental impacts.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	64c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed realignment to the east.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of relocating lower brookbank	64d
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	I support adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system, providing an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system. I support adding a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system. I support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action, in addition to those above. They will help disperse use and provide diverse opportunities for all users.	New Trail Construction		support of new trails	64e
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	I support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education, but will also help with wayfinding.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of environmental study area	64f
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	I support adding the ability for USFS to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system, as necessary, to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	64g
Andrew Mount		11/18/2013	Email	I support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	64h
Steve Huffman		11/18/2013	Email	I DO LIKE THE IDEA OF DEDICATED TRAILS FOR MOUNTAIN BIKERS, ROCK CLIMBERS, HIKERS AND EQUESTRIANS. ONE APPROACH WOULD BE TO LEARN FROM SUCH DESIGNATIONS IN THE RED ROCK DISTRICT.	New Trail Construction		support of user specific trails	65a
Steve Huffman		11/18/2013	Email	MY WIFE AND I LIVE IN FLAGSTAFF IN THE VALLEY CREST NEIGHBORHOOD. WE WALK OUR DOGS AND HIKE THE TRAILS ACCESSIBLE FROM THE ELDEN LOOKOUT RD. SHULTZ PASS RD Y EVERY WEEK, YEAR ROUND. WE LIKE THE IDEA OF IMPROVING THE PARKING AND ACCESS THERE.	Trailhead Improvements		support of improved parking	65b
Mitchell Porter		11/18/2013	Email	I have been riding up in flag for a long time, I would love to see new trails go in, I will defiantly be making more trips to flagstaff to come ride if this passes!	New Trail Construction		support of new trails	66
Carmen Bastek		11/18/2013	Email	I support ALL of the recommendation of Flagstaff Biking Organization. I particularly support the adoption of the "downhill" trails.	New Trail Construction		Support of downhill trails and FBO's proposed plan	67
Burcham Hale		11/18/2013	Email	Although it provides conditions so suitable for soaring hang gliders and paragliders, many pilots are apprehensive to fly there because of the tree line. The possibility of clearing some areas for launching and creating permanent campgrounds for pilots and visitors/hikers/bicyclist, has been a dream that goes back as long as I have been around.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	68

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Tomas Robinson		11/18/2013	Email	Make trail care a priority for this forest district. As it stands now, most of our trails stand by neglected and under maintained. Primary reason: poor design and rainfall, soil conditions, coupled with lots of use. The greater USFS trail system in and around Flagstaff is currently managed from a 25+ year old system.	Other		wantes to see increased maintenance of the area	69a
Tomas Robinson		11/18/2013	Email	I support the Flagstaff Biking Organization plan given to you by Anthony Q	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	69b
Deborah Martinwille		11/18/2013	Email	Please put in our vote for the new proposed trail system as being an excellent innovative and proactive way to work on our trail system We know that some of the social trails we've used are part of this proposal like red onion and others. Red onion developed because we needed cyclist needed an easier way at times to get to other trails like little bear.	New Trail Construction		support of new trails and inclusion of red onion	70
Todd Matyas		11/18/2013	Email	I fully support any new trail building and the re-routing of any eroded trail in the area.	New Trail Construction		supportive of new trails	71
Nathan Cain		11/18/2013	Email	After reviewing the MEDL proposed action, I support all that it contains and could only stress that it contain more.	Other		genrael support	72
Troy Marino		11/17/2013	Email	I have read the proposed actions on FBO's website. As a mountain biker, hiker and climber, their ideas are sound and I agree with all of their proposals for the MEDL planning.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	73
John Nichols		11/17/2013	Email	Keep the trails that are commonly known as "private, BLT and steel". I believe these trails show case in the best possible way what downhill and downhill biking in flagstaff truly mean. making these trails easier and different is not creating great downhill trails. These trails are great trials, they are technical and challenging and incorporate so much of what it means to ride downhill in flagstaff.	New Trail Construction		inclusion of social trails	74a
John Nichols		11/17/2013	Email	If the trail known as "Double-D" has to be removed there should be a trail that can replace it. That trail is like no other on the mountain and is a great trail and incorporates so much natural terrain. I understand that this trail is not in the best area and I would love more than anything to see it stay but I would love a trail that is a lot like in anywhere on that mountain			support of Double-d trail	74b
John Nichols		11/17/2013	Email	I would Like to see the Trails known as "Pickle and Ginger" adopted into the system as downhill traffic only. purpose built downhill travel cross country trails	New Trail Construction		proposed social trails to keep	74c
John Nichols		11/17/2013	Email	I would like to see more downhill purpose built trails with stunts ranging from technical drops to difficult jumps. I would like to see more all-mountain trails built from the top down that are much like "ginger" but longer. I would like to see an area at the Y that includes a dual-slalom track, a aeries of dirt jumps for all users which incorporate stunts and also a pump track.			suggested ideas	74d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
John Nichols		11/17/2013	Email	Lastly I would like to express my opinion that by changing whats going on concerning the downhill trails I do not want to see trails "dumbed down" or made easier.	New Trail Construction		support of advanced downhill trails	74e
Darryl Reed		11/17/2013	Email	I fully support the recommendations set forth by the Flagstaff Biking Organization.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	75a
Darryl Reed		11/17/2013	Email	Well built downhill specific mountain bike trails are of great interest. Mt. Elden offers the perfect location and environment to build these types of trails. This is extremely important for minimizing user conflict and giving the downhill riders designated trails where we know we can safely ride without concern of interferences.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	75b
Darryl Reed		11/17/2013	Email	The addition trail proposed between Schultz Creek Trail Head and the Dry Lake Hills Loop system will be a perfect and needed addition.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	75c
Darryl Reed		11/17/2013	Email	The ability to hold races and events is very important to bring in new people interested in the health of the mountain and its trails.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	75d
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Recommend relocating Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Ask for the US Forest Service to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		support of relocating schultz creek trailhead to the Y	76a
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of flagstaff loop trail	76b
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Recommend adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. Recommend adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		support of keeping social trails	76c
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	76d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Recommend maximizing opportunities for downhill trails. Even if you are not a "downhiller", providing well-managed opportunities for this use helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	76e
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. We have hiked this area extensively and our alignment would make for a much better trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		realign lower brookbank	76f
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	76g
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action!	New Trail Construction		general support of new trails	76h
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with wayfinding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of environmental area	76i
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	76j
Mark Wille		11/17/2013	Email	Support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	76j
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	Although Brookbank and Oldham Trails are a part of Flagstaff history and I'll hate to see them go, the proposed replacement trails will be far more sustainable and provide a better user experience.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of relocating brookbank and oldham	77a
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	I'd also like to see a single-track trail as an alternative to the old 789 road (aka Little Gnarly) which has always been a popular route up to the Dry Lakes			new trail idea	77b
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	The Devils Chair trail and the Scenic Loop on top of Elden will be great (and a great deal of work).			support of new trails	77c
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	Recognition and adoption of downhill mountainbike trails is brilliant! I'm including trails such as "Jedi", "Ginger" and "The Pickle" which are not typically accessed by truck shuttle, but still were created for a downhill bike experience and not really suitable for other uses. Facilities for equestrians and motorcyclists are equally important to allow our forest to serve us all. A trail not mentioned in the plan	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	77d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	A trail not mentioned in the plan is "Red Onion" which connects mid-Elden Road to mid-Sunset Trail (at the top of Little Bear). Although Red Onion is badly laid out and badly eroded, it is heavily used because it's such a convenient connector. I understand that it does pass through an owl PAC but if it could be rerouted to mitigate negative affects, it should be adopted.	New Trail Construction		support of red onion	77e
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	The proposed Loop Trail segment across the South side of Elden will be a useful addition to the system but should not replace Forces of Nature or any of the other highly valued and heavily used trails in that corridor. Instead, it should be down the slope, perhaps on and of of the pipeline but staying more on contour for easier grades. Personally, I think a class 2 or 3 trail would be more appropriate than class 4.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	77f
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	A new Schultz Creek trail head on the City of Flagstaff property at the "Y" would be easier to maintain and access for year-round use and could move public parking off of the private land currently used. An inter-governmental agreement should be sought to create a better long term facility there.	Trailhead Improvements		move schultz creek trailhead to the Y	77g
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	Anything that can be done to facilitate realigning poorly laid out, eroded trails, such as much of Sunset trail, which cannot be fixed inside a 30 foot corridor, would be helpful.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realgning trails	77h
Ken Lane	owner of Absolute Bikes	11/17/2013	Email	Another process that should be easier is permitting events, such as races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	77i
David P. Needham		11/17/2013	Email	I support Flagstaff Biking Organization and their commentary on future use of our great outdoors.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	78a
David P. Needham		11/17/2013	Email	I hope to see future development of more multi-use trails so that we can look forward to exploring Northern Arizona for years to come.	New Trail Construction		support of multi-use trails	78b
Mare Czinar		11/17/2013	Email	As many of these off-the-radar paths have become familiar to the members of the hiking community looking to augment their treks, I'd like to suggest that those that do not present a threat to the forest be absorbed into the system, signed and mapped for all to enjoy safely.	New Trail Construction		support of including social trails	79
Joey Gray		11/16/2013	Email	The ideal improvements would be some tree clearing below the existing south launch as well as some leveling. An addition of a SW launch would be an unbelievable improvement. SW being our dominant wind direction most of the year, a launch facilitating this direction would create Mount Elden's flyability exponentially. To have a drive up flying sight right in town would only add to Flagstaff and the continuing recreational opportunities available here.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	80

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Chris & Theresa Wille		11/16/2013	Email	We would very much like to fly Mt Elden, however due to the current state of the site, it is often not possible. We have traveled to fly in Utah, Nevada and California. It would be great if we could fly in Flagstaff more often and thus keep our tourism dollars closer to home.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	81a
Chris & Theresa Wille		11/16/2013	Email	We welcome any and all trail improvements which would allow us all to enjoy the outdoors more fully.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of trail improvements	81b
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	As a cyclist I would suggest aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area. This will lead to less impact ore interesting riding and less potential conflict among groups.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	82a
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	As chair person of the MBAA this effort will hopefully make it easier for events, such as bike races, to enjoy these trails and bring new visitors to Flagstaff and the local businesses. This includes downhill riding where only a few locations in the state have the terrain to support, making it unique.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events, specifically downhill	82b
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	Relocate Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		move schultz creek trailhead to the Y	82c
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	Add upper Red Onion trail into the system. Addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newlyproposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. Add Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system.Add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank.	New Trail Construction		new trail ideas	82d
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	Move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of rerouting lower brookbank	82e
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	Maximize downhill trails.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	82f
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	Make improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of environmental area	82g
Michael Melley	Mountain Bike Association of Arizona	11/16/2103	Email	I fully support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	82h

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Chandler Papas		11/15/2013	Email	I'm writing to support the proposed changes to Mount Elden trail system and to support any and all changes to the paragliding and hang gliding launch area and trails that support these launches. As one of those user types in the Flagstaff area and having been flying Mount Elden I feel confident in saying these changes would improve the safety as well as the recreational experience for all the Hang gliders and paragliders in the area.	Hang Glider Launch Site		general support and support of hang glide launch site	83
Rick Reed		11/15/2013	Email	I think it is important the Schultz Creek trail be officially located at the Schultz "Y" City Parcel for both convenience of location and for four-season accessibility.	Trailhead Improvements		move schultz creek trailhead to the Y	84a
Rick Reed		11/15/2013	Email	The addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop is essential, as it will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail while helping to disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		dry lakes loop	84b
Rick Reed		11/15/2013	Email	I also hope that opportunities for downhill specific mountain bike trails are maximized. This segment of cycling is growing quickly and Mt. Elden offers the perfect location and environment to build these types of trails. This is extremely important for minimizing user conflict and giving us downhill riders designated trails where we know we can safely ride without concern of interferences. I also hope that some of the current downhill trails can be considered for legal adoption into the trail systems.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	84c
Rick Reed		11/15/2013	Email	I fully support all additions to the trails made in the Proposed action.	New Trail Construction		general support of new trails	84d
Rick Reed		11/15/2013	Email	I also support any opportunities to examine permitted events and races for consideration.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	84e
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Recommend relocating Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz "Y" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Ask for the US Forest Service to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		move schultz creek trailhead to the Y	85a
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	85b
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Recommend adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment.	New Trail Construction		keep red onion	85c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	85d
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Recommend maximizing opportunities for downhill trails. Even if you are not a "downhiller", providing well-managed opportunities for this use helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	85e
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. We have hiked this area extensively and our alignment would make for a much better trail	Trail Relocation and Improvement		reroute lower brookbank	85f
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Recommend adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		keep social trails	85g
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Support FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	85h
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with way-finding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of the environmetnal area	85i
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	85j
Jason Alexander		11/14/2013	Email	Support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	85k
Tim Costello		11/14/2013	Email	I heartily support any improvements to the hang gliding and paragliding launch facilities (aerial trailhead) on Mt. Elden.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	86
Gingher Leyendecker	President - Arizona Hang Gliding and Paragliding Association	11/14/2013	Email	Mt Elden is an exceptional resource and we are hopeful that the improvements will permit greater access and enjoyment for the general public. We also hope that, with some launch safety improvements, Mt Elden will become a more frequently utilized launch site.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	87
Noah Bodman		11/14/2013	Email	I generally support the positions and recommendations of the Flagstaff Biking Organization.	Other		Support the FBO's proposed plan	88

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
John Olson		11/14/2013	Email	Improvements to the hang glider site at the top of Mt. Elden is what it will take to get me flying there again.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	89
Greg Porter		11/14/2013	Email	There is an active hang gliding and paragliding community that launches from two primary areas at Elden. One launch is Southerly and the other faces East. Unfortunately the narrow launch chute between existing trees is treacherous and restricts our launch opportunities to a very specific and infrequent wind direction and speed. This prevents flying on many many days that the site would otherwise be usable for us, and introduces preventable risk even on flyable days. There are many pilots who would like to fly Mt Elden but choose not to because of their concerns about the safety of the current launch area configuration. I hope safety improvements for the hang gliding and paragliding launches can be part of the improvements on Mt Elden.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	90
Jonathan Wright		11/14/2013	Email	I am writing this letter in support of the Flagstaff Biking Organization and their efforts to create an improved system of trails from the Flagstaff Trail through the Shultz Creek "Y" and up in to the Dry Lake Hills. The Proposed Action from FBO is beneficial to all user groups of the Mount Elden recreation area, as well as to the management of the area by the National Forest Service.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	91
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I recommend relocating Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Ask for the US Forest Service to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		move schultz creek trailhead to the Y	92a
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	92b
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I recommend adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. This trail adds a lot of connectivity to the current trail system.	New Trail Construction		support of including red onion	92c
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	92d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I recommend maximizing opportunities for downhill trails by providing well-managed opportunities for this user group helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	92e
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. They have hiked this area extensively and their alignment would hopefully make for a much better trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		relocate lower brookbank	92f
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I recommend adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		support of adding social trails	92g
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I support FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	92h
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action! I understand most all new will be open to bicycles and will help disperse use and provide some great opportunities for hikers, trail runners and equestrians.	New Trail Construction		general support of new trails	92i
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with way-finding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of the environmetnal area	92j
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	92k
John Finch		11/13/2013	Email	I also support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	92l
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I fully support additional opportunities for equestrian users, as shown in map 2. User conflicts between equestrian users and other user groups seem to be on the rise. Perhaps, new trails in the equestrian emphasis area could alleviate conflicts. I would even recommend that new trails in the equestrian emphasis area be restricted to horses and hikers only, with the exception of Little Elden trail being open to bikes as a necessary route in that area, to maintain trail connectivity for bikes.	New Trail Construction	Map 2: Equestrian Emphasis Area - Proposed New Trails & Trailhead	Support of equestrian trails	93a

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	The need for a consolidated trailhead/parking area for the West Elden rock climbing area is absolutely needed. The area is quite busy in the climbing season, and quite apparent in the trash and human waste left behind by irresponsible users. Additional parking spaces, say at most 10, I feel would be adequate. And considering this spot is also the junction of three system trails, I feel a concrete vault type toilet is absolutely necessary. I also support the consolidation of social trails around the climbing area into a comprehensive system to alleviate the visual mess that all the little paths create.	Trailhead Improvements		climbing access trailhead	93b
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I fully support the expansion of the Mount Elden trailhead parking area. It's a fantastic starting point for a number of trails. It has been inadequate for years, is usually overflowing with cars on busy days, and needs to be enlarged. Again a concrete vault type toilet is absolutely necessary.	Trailhead Improvements		mt. elden trailhead	93c
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I'm aware and familiar with the recommendations of Flagstaff Biking Organization (FBO for short), and am a big fan of their advocacy and cooperation on behalf of all trail users, not just bikes.	Other		General support of FBO's proposed plan	93d
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I agree with FBO that the Flagstaff Loop Trail should be aligned with the pipeline corridor, not with Forces of Nature and the other existing social trails in the area. The character of the Loop trail in other parts around Flagstaff more closely fits the terrain of the pipeline corridor	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	93e
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	The social trail known as Red Onion must be preserved and become part of the system. It is an important connector between Mount Elden Lookout road and the trail junction of Sunset and Little Bear, in an area where there are almost no opportunities to connect these two areas. And it is a beautiful trail that should be experienced.	New Trail Construction		Support of including red onion trail	93f
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I want to see the preservation the the trail known as Jedi. This trail provides a riding experience for intermediate to advanced skilled bikers. And this trail is a beautiful hike as well.	New Trail Construction		keep jedi	93g
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I'm excited by, and support, the "Dry Lake Hills Loop Trail" as shown on map 3.	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	support of dry lakes loop	93h

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I support the creation of the "Lower Brookbank reroute" as shown on map 3. It would be a good connector from a place known as the Overlook down to the current Lower Brookbank, in an area that already has a social trail known as Ginger However, I do not support the decommissioning of the current alignment of Lower Brookbank. The existing Lower Brookbank is a wonderful trail, for bikes and hikers, in a beautiful canyon. I really like it's rugged character and occasional difficulty It certainly needs maintenance work, but I feel that it is not a unsustainable trail, and should be kept part of the system	Trail Relocation and Improvement	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	lower brookbank reroute	93i
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I fully support the proposal for downhill specific mountain bike only trails on the north side of Mount Elden. The demand and need is increasingly apparent, as seen in existing user built trails (that are already highly used, demonstrating the demand), as well as user conflicts between downhill riders on trails where downhill riding style is inappropriate. The existing downhill trails could and should be built better in regards to wildlife, erosion, and environmental impact.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	93j
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	Upper Oldham trail should be decommissioned. It has become quite deteriorated, and wasn't built originally to be long lasting sustainable. And, I believe its use is quite limited. Bikes can't ride up it, which means uphill bikers use Elden Lookout road, which is a bad mix with cars on a narrow mountain road. None but the best of bikers can ride down it due to its difficulty and trail quality. It's quite steep, and rugged, and has limited appeal to only the fittest of hikers. By looks of the proposed realignment of Upper Oldham, it seems to fix these issues, and I would like to see this happen.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Upper Oldham Trail	93k
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I agree with FBO's recommendation that there should be a trail to connect the lower part of Sunset to Lower Brookbank. In fact, a social trail in that area already exists, and could easily be improved and connected. This inclusion would really improve trail connectivity in that area, without having to drop in elevation only having to regain elevation, via using Little Gnarly.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	93l
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	I must admit I do not support the decommissioning of the trailhead at Schultz Tank. I feel on peak weekends in the summer, and especially in the fall leaf peeping season, both trailheads are needed. Also, improvements to these parking areas would provide venues for events such as running and mountain bike races I would really like to see improvement and slight expansion of the Schultz/Sunset trailhead. And judging by the amount of trash and human waste in the immediate are, a concrete vault toilet is needed.	Trailhead Improvements		against decomissioning schultz creek trailhead	93m

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Rick Stanionis		11/13/2013	Email	As well, I really feel strongly the trailhead at the lower end of Schultz Creek needs improvement. Parking is a free for all on summer weekends, it's common to see cars on a busy weekend parked in inappropriate places. And similar to the other high use trailheads, human waste is beoming something more than just a nuisance, it's becoming a real health danger.	Trailhead Improvements		lower schultz creek trailhead	93n
Ian Settlemire		11/13/2013	Email	I would like to return again and having dedicated XC and downhill trails would be a great benefit for all riders.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill and XC trails	94
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and recommend relocating Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Ask for the US Forest Service to seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		support of relocating schultz treahead to the Y	95a
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and recommend aligning the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	95b
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and recommend adding upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment.	New Trail Construction		support of red onion trail	95c
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and recommend FBO's recommended addition of a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	95d
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and recommend maximizing opportunities for downhill trails. Even if you are not a "downhiller", providing well-managed opportunities for this use helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	95e
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of FBO's recommendation to move lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		realign lower brookbank	95f
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and recommend adding Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		keep ginger and jedi	95g
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of FBO's recommendation to add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	95h

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action!	New Trail Construction		support of new trails	95i
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with way-finding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of environmental area	95j
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support for the Forest Service having the ability to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and userexperience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	95k
Chris Cocalis	President/CEO of Pivot Cycles	11/13/2013	Email	We are in support of and highly recommend enhanced opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use events	95l
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	Have you considered working with Snow Bowl to provide a downhill park to take the shuttle traffic off of Mt. Elden and Schultz Pass Road? That way, you can decommission the many unauthorized downhill only trails impacting the natural resources and you wouldn't have to impact another sensitive area by building the downhill only trail on the south side of Mt. Elden. You can then close the gates at Schultz and Elden (still allowing tower maintenance workers to pass through) year-round to prevent further shuttling but still allow for the recreational enjoyment of all other users. The tread of the system trails will last much longer without the shuttlers who skid, make jump features, and dirt/rock/log packed banked turns that funnel water onto trails. There would also be less user conflict. Snow Bowl can provide parking, bathrooms, EMTs, an already developed site so no further natural resources are impacted. Snow Bowl could provide season passes, weekly passes, or daily passes.	New Trail Construction		against downhill trails	54g
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	How will you enforce no further unauthorized trail building? When the downhill trails were first being built and the question was asked "What can be done to get this under control?", the most common answer was that the Forest Service doesn't have the man power or budget to effectively deal with the problem. Will this change?	Other		enforcement of future unauthorized trails	54h
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	Does the proposed Dry Hills Loop and Brookbank reroute go through or encroach upon the private land on the top of Dry Lake Hills?	New Trail Construction		question about dry lakes loop	54i

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	Another concern is that the Brookbank reroute is not really a reroute. It isn't even in the same drainage. The objective listed for rerouting Brookbank is mitigate wildlife concerns, provide for a sustainable trail system and provide connectivity between Schulz Loop and Upper and Lower Oldham trails. The proposed "reroute" will still impact wildlife. The person/people proposing this route has said they have walked the area, but it seems like it will have the same sustainability problems or even have more problems than the to-be-decommissioned Brookbank. The proposed reroute doesn't meet FS policy for slope and the volcanic terrain will make it difficult to have a sustainable tread (Rocky Ridge has a problem holding soil even though it follows the contour so it has less slope to deal with). There are two problem areas on the existing Brookbank. The first one is below the last switch back and the other at the top below where Upper Brookbank links in. The lower problem could be avoided by decommissioning Brookbank from the first switchback to the last switchback and then use the existing old wagon road that comes in from the west side (left going up). This old wagon road links back to Brookbank at the last switchback. The road may need a little work but mostly just down tree removal. The upper problem area could be fixed with a comparatively short reroute. The rest of the trail just needs a few rolling grade dips and some out sloping to get the water off of the trail before it can accumulate and cause erosion. Pros in keeping the current Brookbank are that you wouldn't have to impact another area, time and funds savings, and preventing further unauthorized trail building that would be	New Trail Construction			54j
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	If new trails are approved, will unauthorized trails be decommissioned and will effort be put into fixing existing system trails before using funds to build new trails that aren't going to be easy to build due to steep slopes and the volcanic nature of Dry Lakes and Mt. Elden?	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		question on decommission trails	54k
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	Concern about Upper Oldham reroute: the proposed reroute links quite a few unauthorized trails. Again, will all of these unauthorized trails be decommissioned and will you be able to enforce it?	Trail Relocation and Improvement		concern about upper Oldham reroute	54l

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	Concern: Special event permit holders should follow the permit rules and take there course markings down and pick up trash along the course. They should also remove staples left on the beautiful wood Forest Service signs. There is still flagging left behind from the last event held on Dry Lakes/Schultz. They shouldn't be issued a permit if they don't carefully police the course after an event. The course should be more spotless then when they started.	Special-Use Trail Events		concern about special event permits	54m
Joan Martini		11/13/2013	Email	Suggestion: To avoid user conflicts, it would be nice to have a dog walker/hiker/runner (no bikes) trail from the Schultz Creek Trailhead up into Dry Lake Hills without having to use the highly traveled Schultz Creek trail. A lot of people are already hiking/running these trails daily, but downhill bikers have been building features to try to ride the steep social trails. The social trails lasted for years until the downhill bikers tried to take them over. Could we make a system loop trail (incorporating the existing trails) closed to bicycles to provide an experience like you have on wilderness trails but close to town? There are a couple of areas that need work but the biggest improvement would be to sign it for no bikes (similar to Elden Lookout Trail)	New Trail Construction		support of non-biking trails	54n
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	I believe that relocating the Schultz trail head to the "Y" Parcel at the Elden lookout road and Schultz pass road junction because this is what I personally use as the trail head and it is much easier to access as a 4 season trail head.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of relocating Schultz creek trailhead to the Y	96a
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	I support aligning the flagstaff loop trail at the foot of mt Elden along the pipeline corridor rather than along the forces of nature trail. Also upper red onion is a very valuable trail to the entire trails system allowing a connector to little bear, sunset and upper brookbank without going the entire way up mt Elden lookout road to the top of sunset.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	96b
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	A Trail from the Schultz creek trail head to the newly proposed Dry lake hills loop would an alternative option from that trail head which will minimize traffic and user conflicts on the current trails.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	96c
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	I support all types of cycling including "Downhilling" and feel that purpose built trails will help minimize user conflicts on other trails and create a safer environment by offering regularly maintained trails that do not have natural hazards on them such as downed trees.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	96d
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	I feel that FBO's alignment of lower brookbank would make for a better trail over the current proposed re-alignment.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		lower brookbank	96e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	Ginger and Jedi Trails are both trails that I frequently ride and feel that they are a great addition to the system as an advanced-expert level trail that is not otherwise available on the dry lake hills/Elden trail system, I also feel that a connector between the lower section of sunset to the top of lower brookbank would add a lot of versatility and connectivity to the whole trail system.	New Trail Construction		add Jedi and ginger	96f
Chris Antonovics		11/13/2013	Email	As a whole I support all of Flagstaff Biking organizations proposed actions for our forest and will stand behind what they propose to the forest service in order to maintain our amazing riding and other activities that brought me to this town!	Other		general support of FBO's proposed plan	96g
Tim Rosenow		11/13/2013	Email	I would like to see, and would support, a measure to relocate and make improvements to the Schultz Creek Trailhead by moving it to the Y at the intersection of Schultz Creek Road 420 and Elden Lookout Road. Through the years, I've observed this area to be a primary, and ideal, location for the trailhead. Commonly used on a regular basis by myself as well as many others, by making this the primary trailhead, it would offer year round access to the Schultz Creek area and the network of trails and recreational opportunities that lead from this point. My suggestion would be to perform this transition in stages, so as not to incur the full brunt of cost all at once; but to spread this out by staging necessary improvements such as grading, paving, expansion, and signage first and ending with the possibility of adding amenities such as a vault toilet or other type of restroom facility.	Trailhead Improvements		move Schultz creek trailhead to the Y	97a
Tim Rosenow		11/13/2013	Email	I welcome these changes and improvements to network of trails that exist in the Mount Elden/Dry Lake Hills area and look forward to supporting, helping to improve, and utilizing these recreational opportunities.	Other		general support of MEDL	97b
Gill Couto		11/13/2013	Email	I want to express my support for the Mount Elden Dry Lake Hills Recreation Planning Proposed Action.	Other		general support	98
Sheila Walsh		11/13/2013	Email	I totally agree with the proposed downhill single use trails for downhill biking and hiking. I think safety has to be foremost for these users and all users.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	99a
Sheila Walsh		11/13/2013	Email	I also understand and agree with the closing of trails that are no longer manageable, not safe and contributing to erosion.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		support of decommissioning trails	99b
Sheila Walsh		11/13/2013	Email	I look forward to the signage alerting all users to trail status and safety, as we had discussed.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of increased signage	99c

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Mark Knight	SonoraWings.com	11/13/2013	Email	The Mount Elden hang glider launch area has for a long time needed grooming and minor improvements, just to make it a safer place to launch hang gliders. It would take very little work to improve this site. If we cut out some dead trees killed in a past forest fire. This would open up direction of launching directly into winds and improving the safety of the launch area.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	100a
Mark Knight	SonoraWings.com	11/13/2013	Email	More defined and stabilized trails would improve mountain biking effects on the trails. There are areas that wash out when it rains and only get eroded more from mountain bikes. Simple culvert or drainage improvements would make less impact from use.	New Trail Construction		support of new trail construction	100b
Mark Knight	SonoraWings.com	11/13/2013	Email	The Arizona Hang Glider And Paragliding Association would totally support a permit system to help maintain this site for environmental stability, safety and recreational use	Other		support of permitting	100c
Eric Marlatt		11/12/2013	Email	I'm really looking forward to the proposed improvements to the hang glider/paraglider site on Elden.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	101
Andrew Rayhill		11/12/2013	Email	As a pilot who has flown Mt Elden, I strongly support the proposition to improve the Hang Glider launch there. I would think that clearing some trees away would improve the usability and safety of the launch.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	102
Steve Konves		11/12/2013	Email	I'm a Flagstaff Paraglider pilot, and have been launching Elden for many years. It is my favorite local site. If we could have that type of launch on Elden, it would be very attractive.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	103
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/12/2013	Email	I want to reiterate FBO's support for signage in key locations to better explain how cyclists should interact with horses, and to highlight areas where folks are more likely to encounter equestrians. (This would include several points along or near the AZ Trail below Snowbowl...) Maybe FBO, CHA and the Flagstaff District could co-apply for a grant to fund this signage? Maybe RTP funds?	Trail Relocation and Improvement		increased signage	104a
Sally Stults		11/12/2013	Email	At the same time, my fear is that a mentality might develop that Equestrians need to stay in these areas and not intrude on trail systems favored by Mountain Bikers. While an equestrian loop trail is a great thing, no one wants to become bored by continually riding over the same terrain for a limited distance when a horse and rider can easily cover more miles.	New Trail Construction		equestrian use in the project area	105a
Sally Stults		11/12/2013	Email	At one point, I was told that the Forest Service could not afford to install triangular, yellow Yield signs in areas on trails on the East side of Mtn. Elden that are commonly used by fast moving ATVs and horses. Going forward, I hope the funds for this project will cover the cost to place these Yield signs in key areas of new and existing multi-user trails.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of increased signage	105b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Sally Stults		11/12/2013	Email	CHA was also told that FS could not afford to install equestrian friendly gates in place of barb wire gates, which is an issue if the grazing lease were to continue on the East side of the Peaks. Will the grazing lease ever return to the area?	Other		horse friendly gates	105c
Sally Stults		11/12/2013	Email	Wondering if funds been allocated in the MEDL project to cover repairs to the Horse Camp now necessary due to flooding in the area?	Other		repairs to horse camp	105d
Robert Cline		11/12/2013	Email	I support the Flagstaff Biking Organization position on Mount Elden Dry Lake Hills Recreation Plan. I enjoy purpose built single track trails to ride my Mountain Bike, FUTS type trails, downhill trails are all important.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails and FBO's proposed plan	106
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	Sean Murphy once told me the biggest mistake Gene Waldrip ever made when he was in charge at the Peaks, was to reward the illegal trail builders by adopting some of their illegally built trails into the system. I guess he has a short memory because you'd both be hard pressed to explain how this proposal isn't rewarding downhill mountain bikers who have been a plague on Mt. Elden. They are already laughing at the idea of you closing some of their trails. They plan to agree to anything you offer them to get new downhill trails and then reestablish any trails you try to close down. Totally predictable. I don't know the name of the man who posts as Raising Arizona on MTBR and has been courting you and Sean, but he and Anthony have you all snookered. There will be people at next weeks meeting suggesting there will be a huge increase in traffic on Elden Lookout Road. They don't know the half of it. There will be new shuttle vehicles with Absolute Bikes name on them as soon as the new downhill trails get built. It'll be big business hauling hard-core thrill seekers to the top of Elden, so they can, as they say, shred the trails down the mountain.	New Trail Construction		against downhill trails	107a
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	The new Lower Brookbank Trail could be as special as Little Bear was to cross country riders. But there is talk amongst downhillers that they will ask for it to be steeper than a max of 7% grade. Please don't let them hijack what could be the only good thing to come out of this.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		concern over lower brookbank	107b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	<p>One poster on MTBR mentioned the class 4 trail you mentioned along the base of Elden, from Elden Lookout Trail to Elden Lookout Road. Now that I have spent a decade working to establish a perfect single track trail that you and Sean and I walked a bit of, and worked hard to maintain every inch of it from Sandy Seep Trail to Lower Oldham, I hope it doesn't get turned into a paved beginner trail. Just run a trail along the gas pipeline for commuters, if you really have to have something to call a Loop Trail. Or stay below the pipeline as originally planned.</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	107c
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	<p>I do like the idea of building an equestrian trail that leads equestrians away from Little Elden and north to Timberline. Another option I have suggested in the past is to make a dedicated trail for equestrians that parallels Little Elden. The equestrians have already roughed in a trail that is located between Little Elden and the road. It joins Little Elden a quarter mile before it meets Little Bear. Just keep the horse trail between Little Elden Trail and the road until you get up to Schultz Tank, except for a short connector that allows them to get onto Little Bear. The benefit is reduced conflicts and each year the entire month of June and parts of May and July, the equestrians turn Little Elden into powder and manure. This would give them a better experience and allow riders a firm trail surface.</p>	New Trail Construction		equestrian use in the project area	107d
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	<p>At some point, you'll have to do something about Sandy Seep. I've tried everything I can to get Sean to dump a few truckloads of soil over the sand to get it to firm up and allow bikes to ride over it. Just dump soil there and maybe more soil on the cinders on the AZ Trail just across highway 89 as you descend to picture canyon. Volunteers can spread it over the trail and monsoon rains will do the rest of the work to firm up those loose sections.</p>	Other		sandy seep	107e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	I know, I know, you only want ideas for Dry Lake Hills. If it were me, I'd close the gates to everyone but people working on the towers. Screw downhillers who destroy everything they touch. They know these new trails won't be sustainable. I think they are calling them maintainable instead. They (FBO and Anthony) will suck every volunteer day each year to do trail maintenance on their beat up downhill trails made legal by the FS. Five years from now they will probably go even further and ask or tell you they want motorized access in the area of the new trails. My feelings are you don't negotiate with terrorists, and you sure don't let them call the shots.	Other		generally negative feelings towards the project	107f
Dan Overton		11/11/2013	Email	Can you get the new trail built out behind Buffalo Park next year? Think of it as a promise delayed, yet still kept.	New Trail Construction		trail behind buffalo park	107g
Ray Hemmele		11/11/2013	Email	I think improvements and new trails would be a great addition. I know the summer rains beat up many of the less sustainable trails and think re-alignment/re-routes would be very beneficial.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	107
Volkwear		11/11/2013	Email	New trails are always good woot woot.	Other		general support	109
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	I support the trail plan proposed action given by Flagstaff Bicycle Organization (FBO) to the USFS last year.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	110a
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Red Onion. Which is an existing non-system trail that connects the western and eastern part of the trail system together. Red Onion is a vital connector that needs to be included in the plan. The trail basically runs from the intersection of Sunset and Little Bear and travels down to Mt. Elden Lookout road. Without it, the total riding experience is knocked down a notch. With it, trail users can better connect the Oldham and proposed DH trails in the MEDL proposal.	New Trail Construction		add red onion trail	110b
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Jedi, which is an existing non-system trail that is good working order as it exists today. This connects the northwestern top of the DLH to Schultz creek, and avoids the old road/trail Little Gnarly. Many people (bikers and hikers) use this trail often and it provides a unique experience and views of the peaks. It travels through a pretty part of the dry lake hills and is a true trail, not a converted road.	New Trail Construction		add Jedi trail	110c
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	A new trail proposal called "Buck Rut" which connects the top the DLH southwest section down to the Schultz Creek trail near the intersection of trail connector to Ft. Valley trails. This challenging and fun trail would divert much downhill traffic off of the Schultz creek trail, lessing conflicts between trail users. This would connect with the proposed DLH loop trail.	New Trail Construction		Buck Rut trail	110d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Climb 3, an existing jeep road now mtb track that leads up parallel to the Sunset trail leaving from Schultz Pass. This track needs to be developed as a sustainable climb that helps divert user conflicts on the sunset trail. People moving uphill on Sunset have often been met with people coming down sunset fast on a bike. This road/trail would need sustainable sections created.	New Trail Construction		Develop Climb 3 Trail	110e
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Ginger. This existing user created bike trail goes down from the viewpoint on the southeastern part of the DLH. This trail offers a challenging option for expert riders. As a hiking trail it offers great accessibility to the top of the DLH.	New Trail Construction		Add Ginger to the downhill trails	110f
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Parking at the "Y", makes this a four season parking area whereas the gate above closes. I ask that the USFS and the city create a great entrance to the DLH.	Trailhead Improvements		move Schultz creek trailhead to the Y	110g
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Reroute Brookbank further east that is in the proposal. It makes more sense (not in the gully where ginger is located).	Trail Relocation and Improvement		reroute brookbank	110h
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	For the Flagstaff Loop Trail, have it follow closely to the gas pipeline rather than uphill where Rocky Ridge is located.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	110i
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Work with FBO to establish a mountain bike specific trail crew who has expertise and knowledge about both bikes and trails. Work on creating a modern trail system that allows bikes and hikers. Horses can go anywhere. And allow the widespread use of volunteer care for our existing but poorly constructed sections of trails. Make them stop being water drains and erosion nightmares.	Other		develop a trail crew	110j
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Allow the creation of downhill and one way trails for mountain bikers.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	110k
Tomas Robison		11/11/2013	Email	Support guiding (bike & hike) to take place in the DLH.	Other		Allow guiding	110l
Jason Tullous		11/11/2013	Email	We love the area and would like to see continued improvement on the trail system specifically purpose built trails. It's great to have a variety of different ability levels from cycling to hiking and for everyone from the elite level to my seven year old son. And specifically use the trails starting at Schultz Creek Y.	Other		general support of improved trails	111
Jason First	Over the Edge Sedona Bike Shop	11/10/2013	Email	I wanted to write you a letter in support of Flagstaff Biking Organization's proposals	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	112a
Jason First	Over the Edge Sedona Bike Shop	11/10/201	Email	I am in big support of the purpose-built mountain bike trails that are on the planning table, especially for the "downhill" mountain bike category. I feel this is an important part of the trail system, it is a fast growing category of mountain biking, and it's a category that is under-served in Northern Arizona	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	112b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jason First	Over the Edge Sedona Bike Shop	11/10/201	Email	I would very much like to see Ginger and Jedi trails adopted, they are fun trails already in place that are helping to serve this category. And, please consider the Red Onion connector trail - to provide an uphill option without having to ride Elden Rd all the way up alongside the car traffic.	New Trail Construction		add social trails	112c
Jason First	Over the Edge Sedona Bike Shop	11/10/201	Email	I also want to voice support of the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area, to have better signage and interpretive facilities	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		increased signage	112d
Jason First	Over the Edge Sedona Bike Shop	11/10/201	Email	I also support adding the ability for the FS to more easily realign poorly aligned trails that are eroding away. Being able to be more proactive will only add to the sustainability of these trails as the community grows.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support for realigning trails	112e
Jason First	Over the Edge Sedona Bike Shop	11/10/201	Email	I would like to see more opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support for special use events	112f
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Relocate Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trail head. Please seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trail head.	Trailhead Improvements		move Schultz creek trailhead to the Y	113a
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Align the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	113b
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Add a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the "stacked-loops" concept in the Dry Lake Hills.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	113c
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Maximize opportunities for downhill trails. Providing well-managed opportunities for this use helps to minimize user conflicts, allows the construction of sustainable trails that can be legally maintained minimizing environmental impacts, and is instrumental in introducing some new riders to mountain biking.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	113d
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Add Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system.	New Trail Construction		add Jedi and ginger	113e
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system.	New Trail Construction		new trail idea	113f
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Support all of the trail additions brought forth in the Proposed Action.	New Trail Construction		support of new trails	113g

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Support the improvements to the Mount Elden Environmental Study Area. Better interpretive facilities and signage will not only enhance opportunities for education as is the mission of this area, but will also help with way finding in this area.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of increased signage	113h
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Support adding the ability for the Forest Service to realign poorly aligned trails that are already part of the system as necessary to address erosion and user-experience concerns as stated in the Proposed Action.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	113i
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	Support enhanced and appropriate opportunities for permitted trail events, like bike races.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use trail events	113j
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	I strongly support the Lower Oldham Relocation and the improvement and reclassification of that section of the Loop Trail to a class 4 trail, however, I agree with FBO in the suggestion to align the eastern section with the Pipeline corridor instead of Forces of Nature	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Lower Oldham relocation	113k
Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom		11/9/2013	Email	There are many Forest Access points with signage, signs asking trail users to respect private property, and interpretive signs in this area. There are very few navigational signs. I recommend adding information about trail names and navigation to the existing signs about forest access, rules, and interpretation. Hopefully this could offer a low cost way to direct residents to system trails. As a resident that hikes and bikes in this area I often have a hard time figuring out if I am on a user created social trail or a system trail since there are so few navigational signs.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		increased signage	113l
Kitty Mitchell		11/7/2013	Email	I have complete confidence in the plans the Forest Service has proposed for the area. I believe they know what is best for a mountain that has been loved to death for many years. I support whatever they deem best for the environment and recreational opportunities in the Mt. Elden/Dry Lake Hills Recreation Planning project area.	Other		general support	114
David Unruh		11/3/2013	Email	Through well-maintained and designed trails, erosion and degradation can be kept in check. For the most part, mountain bikers stay on the trail, and prefer to stop at designated areas along said trail. If these sorts of features were built, extensive off-trail traffic could be minimized. I hope this initiative passes, as I think a more extensive trail network would greatly benefit the local economy, the cycling community, and the National Forest.	Other		general support	115
B K		11/3/2013	Email	Please protect the equestrian trails at Mt Elden!!	Other		support of equestrian trails	116

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Erik Kruse		11/1/2013	Email	I am writing to express my support of Flagstaff Biking Organization efforts to work with the Forest Service, the City of Flagstaff, and others to create and maintain sustainable singletrack mountain biking trails.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	117
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	We also strongly recommend that District seek the input of professionals such as IMBA Trail Solutions and Gravity Logic and trail users especially when implementing some of the more technically challenging downhill and all-mountain style trails. Consulting with professionals particularly on more specific aspects such as trail flow and the incorporation of challenging features will assure that these trails best address the qualitative needs of these riders.	Other		seek professional help with eh downhill trails	104b
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Where the District is choosing to convert road to single-track trail, in particular in coordination with the Flagstaff Watershed Protection Project, (FWPP), please bear in mind the fact that only closing one side of a two-track does not yield "single-track" trail. Better management strategies incorporate deviating trail tread from the road within corridor, moving large objects such as boulders into the obliterated roadbed, ripping and re-seeding. Please coordinate with the road construction personnel in advance of the construction of new roads as part of the FWPP to implement strategies that will lead to the best trails as part of the MEDL implementation later. For example, if imported materials are to be used in the roadbed, consider using the City of Flagstaff's "FUTS Mix" rather than other looser gravels where the road will be converted to Flagstaff Loop Trail class 4 trail.				104c
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Please recognize that this project's success is extremely dependent upon the details inherent in recognizing and providing for an exceptionally diverse array of recreational needs, and that the details of those needs are difficult to express.	Other		general support	104d
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	It is important to recognize the substantial number of user-created and historic trails and routes that are part of the existing condition, and what these trails represent. (Most of these routes are shown in the maps accompanying the PA.) We understand that the any action the District takes will result in a net reduction in route mileage. We want to be sure that the District recognizes that this is a quantitative net loss in recreational opportunities as well as a substantial and quantitative reduction in environmental impact. Our hope is that this loss in quantity will be accompanied by a substantial qualitative improvement that will encourage users to eschew using and constructing unauthorized routes, leading to continued minimization of environmental impact as a result of the implementation of this planning.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		concern over loss of trail mileage	104e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	We strongly support the District citing the use of the Forest Service Trails Handbook Best Management Practices. We also strongly recommend that District seek the input of professionals such as IMBA Trail Solutions and Gravity Logic and trail users especially when implementing some of the more technically challenging downhill and all-mountain style trails. Consulting with professionals particularly on more specific aspects such as trail flow and the incorporation of challenging features will assure that these trails best address the qualitative needs of these riders	New Trail Construction		seek IMBA assistance in trail building	104f
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Where the District is choosing to convert road to single-track trail, in particular in coordination with the Flagstaff Watershed Protection Project, (FWPP), please bear in mind the fact that only closing one side of a two-track does not yield "single-track" trail. Better management strategies incorporate deviating trail tread from the road within corridor, moving large objects such as boulders into the obliterated roadbed, ripping and re-seeding. Please coordinate with the road construction personnel in advance of the construction of new roads as part of the FWPP to implement strategies that will lead to the best trails as part of the MEDL implementation later. For example, if imported materials are to be used in the roadbed, consider using the City of Flagstaff's "FUTS Mix" rather than other looser gravels where the road will be converted to Flagstaff Loop Trail class 4 trail. We would like to be closely involved in the specific corridor layouts of most of these new trails.	New Trail Construction		trail construction specifics	104g
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Equestrian Trail System We support the need for this system. It is our understanding from conversations with our friends in the horseback riding community that opportunities for riding that minimize interaction with cyclists are better than riding on trails with lots of cyclists. Although we do not support this system being closed to bicycles, we feel that the location of these trails will organically lend itself to low levels of bicycle use. Its proximity to the Elden Springs Horse Camp and away from the multi-use Flagstaff Urban Trail System and other multi-use trailheads is ideal for these users. We also see this trail system as directly beneficial to cyclists seeking more remote opportunities for exploration of the mountain. (This does not imply that these trails would attract a substantial number of cyclists in any way, as this is a relatively small number of riders.)	New Trail Construction		equestrian trails	104h

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Providing ample opportunities for this use that are separate from the rest of the multi-use system will greatly alleviate user conflict concerns as these riders will be able to ride nearer their limits without potentially startling or colliding with other users.	New Trail Construction		downhill trails	104i
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Please consider adding some additional routes within the general area proposed for downhill mountain bike trails. Additionally, and/or alternately, consider using wider corridors that would allow for multiple options along these trails. This approach could provide for multiple experiences with minimal impact, as well as provide options for various skill levels.	New Trail Construction		downhill trails	104j
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Trail on south face of Mt. Elden This is a great opportunity to help disperse hiking use onto an additional route and provide for a long day-hike option when combined with Elden Lookout Trail. Although we support this as a trail with a Designed Use for hiking, we do not think bicycles should be prohibited from using it, although perhaps bicycles should not be included as a Managed Use. Our observation is that the face of Elden is such that constraints in trail design alone would prevent most people from taking their bicycles on this trail, but should someone want to "hike-a-bike" and ride some of it, this should be allowed.	New Trail Construction		south Elden trails	104k
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	West Elden Climbing Access Trail Well-managed recreation has fewer impacts to environmental resources. We support this.	New Trail Construction		west Elden climbing access	104l
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Scenic Loop Trail Although we fully support this as Designed Use for hiking, we think that mountain biking should be recognized as a Managed Use on this trail. The location of this trail and the "scenic" aspect of it would make for great exploration opportunities using the new alignment, as proposed, for Upper Oldham Trail and Sunset Trail. Additionally, part of this Loop would provide access to the downhill mountain bike trails. We recommend prominent signage advising riders that mountain bikes should yield to hikers and equestrians along the parts of the Scenic Loop Trail that would be used for access to the Downhill Mountain Bike Trails	New Trail Construction		scenic loop trail	104m

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Dry Lake Hills Trail System</p> <p>We strongly support this, as these loops were part of our proposal submitted during preliminary scoping. However our vision included additional routes that helped to address user conflict, additional needs and other changes to the Forest Service Trail System. We will discuss the need for those additions later in these comments.</p>	New Trail Construction		dry lake hills system	104n
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Trail Relocation and Improvement</p> <p>We strongly support the need for reroutes in order to improve many of the existing system trails. We have helped to coordinate hundreds of hours of volunteer time to repair trails that are unsustainably built or aligned on old roadbeds just to see these trails decimated yet again by monsoon rains. As an example we have worked at least three times with the Forest Service trail crew on Lower Brookbank in the past decade. Currently that trail is badly rutted and covered in loose rock. The current alignment cannot be repaired in a permanent way because it was established on an ancient roadbed at an unsustainable grade. Trail maintenance is a normal part of any system regardless of how well trails are aligned and built, but many of the current MEDL System trails require an inordinate amount of maintenance because of their poor initial layout. We would like to be closely involved in the choosing of the realignment corridors for these trails.</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		general support of trail relocation and improvement	104o

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>General Trail Signage</p> <p>We support this action, but we suggest that it could be expanded. The Red Rock District has implemented signage strategies that assist in route finding as well as “informing the public on current and proposed trail use restrictions.” These signs include area maps showing system trails in the immediate proximity. This strategy has been implemented in various other higher recreational use areas and adds a stronger sense to trail users that they are present on a managed system, which can help better achieve “increase(d) compliance and safe, sustainable use of system trails and decrease unauthorized trail construction.”</p> <p>We would also like to see more signage informing trail users of proper trail etiquette. We believe strongly that education and reinforcement of proper trail etiquette is one of the best tools to minimize user conflict issues. We have been surprised that many mountain bikers have never been properly educated on yielding to other trail users and yielding to uphill traffic, in spite of our efforts and the efforts of IMBA, the US Forest Service and others. Signs informing cyclists of areas of higher levels of equestrian use would also be helpful. Well-placed signs, at the top of long descending sections of trail for example, could improve trail user experiences for all.</p> <p>We would like all of this signage to be implemented in a manner that is not overly intrusive to the landscape.</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of increases signage	104p
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Brookbank Trail</p> <p>As may be apparent from our comments above, we strongly support the realignment of Brookbank Trail to improve sustainability and user satisfaction.</p> <p>We have a different recommendation than that shown on the map for the PA. (Please see our attached map.) We have hiked this area extensively and based upon our substantial history working with the Forest Service laying out and constructing trails, we ask that you strongly consider our proposal as it would place the trail in better soil, in better trees for a more desirable experience and address some substantial issues with rock outcroppings in the vicinity of this trail.</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of relocating brookbank trail	104q

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Upper Oldham Trail</p> <p>This trail suffers from a significant lack of use and terrible erosion because of its poor alignment. Cyclists who wish to access the top of Sunset Trail are more apt to climb Elden Lookout Road than to hike-a-bike up Oldham, leading to potential for conflicts between people driving Elden Lookout Road and a less than desirable riding experience. Realigning this trail would make it useful for climbing or descending on a bicycle and we think far more palatable for the average hiker, trail runner or equestrian as well.</p> <p>Please note that there are minor differences between the alignment shown in the PA and what we are showing on our attached map. Extending the overall length of this trail will reduce the grade substantially, which will improve its sustainability and usefulness. Additionally, moving the alignment away from Elden Lookout Road as much as possible, especially on steeper slopes, will help to address the runoff from the road that has repeatedly damaged this trail in the past.</p> <p>Additionally we propose that this trail connect to Red Onion Trail, a user-created route that we are recommending for adoption onto the Forest Service system. We will discuss the need for this addition later in these comments.</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		upper Oldham trail	104r
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Little Elden Trail</p> <p>Sections of this trail were initially poorly aligned on existing fall-line roadbeds. We have looked at other solutions for these sections and can offer no other good solution besides realignment to single-track built on contour</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		little Elden trail	104s

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>LOWER ELDEN TRAIL RELOCATION/ FLAGSTAFF LOOP TRAIL (L) IMPROVEMENTS</p> <p>We are exceptionally enthusiastic about these changes to the trail system! Re-designating these trails as class 4 and improving their connectivity to the Flagstaff Urban Trail System, (FUTS), and Buffalo Park will be instrumental in highlighting the Flagstaff Loop Trail's mission as a gateway between the City of Flagstaff's FUTS and the Forest Service trail system. This trail will serve as a de facto part of the FUTS system because of its location and connectivity while at the same time providing access to the rest of the MEDL Trail System. This trail will serve beginner mountain bikers and kids, bike commuters, after work dog walkers, joggers as well as all of the usual Forest Service trail users.</p> <p>It is very important that the realignment of the Flagstaff Loop Trail along the base of Mt. Elden follow the basic corridor of the pipeline, although along contours rather than in a straight line, as shown in our attached maps. Re-designating the class 3 Forces of Nature Trail and the eastern section of the Pipeline Trail as Class 4 will substantially change the character of the Environmental Study Area. The location of these trails would also make rebuilding to a more developed trail classification virtually impossible. Many of our members value the current, more rugged characteristics of these trails. Moving the FLT along with the re-designation as class 4 as we are suggesting would better address the need for a "neighborhood trail" since it is closer to the City. Keeping the more traditional class 3 designation of Forces of Nature and Pipeline Trails in conjunction with this new class 4 trail will provide for a more diverse array of recreational options.</p> <p>It is our understanding that the alignment for this section is shown</p>	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	104t
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Consolidate Schultz Tanks and Sunset Trailheads</p> <p>Although these trailheads are located very close to each other, they serve very different purposes. Many people park at Schultz Tank to hike Weatherford Trail. Parking at Sunset Trailhead would add another mile to an out-and-back hike on Weatherford. With that in mind, it may make sense to add a connector trail from Schultz Pass Road and Secret Trail across to Weatherford Trail to shortcut this access. We recognize that technically this trail would fall outside the geographic scope of the PA. This trailhead should have good signage informing cyclists descending Little Elden and riding Sunset Trail that the trails in this area are more apt to have equestrian traffic than other trails on the system. Please consider the feasibility of adding a pit toilet to this trailhead.</p>	Trailhead Improvements		Schultz pass trailhead connector trail	104u

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Relocate Little Elden Trailhead; West Elden Trailhead; Elden Scenic Trailhead; Elden Lookout Trailhead expansion We support all of these as necessary improvements. Please see comments above regarding signage for trail etiquette. This is especially important for the Elden Scenic Trailhead as it will serve as a staging area for the downhill mountain bike trails and cyclists riding Sunset Trail.	Trailhead Improvements		trailhead improvements	104v
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Special-Use trail events Our strongest concern regarding special-use events is that an adequate number of options for routes is offered. Most mountain bike events require routes for varying race categories. Events usually require loops so that participants are not running into one another. Some of our recommended additional trails below will be helpful in providing for special-use events while providing alternative routes to minimize conflict for other users during events. Please consider allowing the use of the downhill mountain bike trails for special-use events. Any limits on seasonal use, specifically the limiting of events in June and July for fire danger, should be guidelines and not hard restrictions. Similarly, limiting to one event per month and 4-6 events per year should also be a guideline. Allowing for more events may be appropriate based upon the size and impact of any given event. Also, please do not prohibit staging events on Forest Service land, although limits may be appropriate.	Special-Use Trail Events		support of special use trails events	104w
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area improvements We strongly support better management for the ESA as the value of this area as an educational tool has suffered because of the lack of signage and interpretive improvements. Better alignment of many sections of these trails will make them more apparently part of a trail system and discourage users from finding their own way leading to more unauthorized trails. Please consider adding some of the user-created routes in this area and adjacent to this area to address the demand for additional access that is expressed by the proliferation of routes in this area. An expanded and better-signed trail system will help to reduce the continued expansion of user-created routes. "Through-routes" in the ESA should be signed so that cyclists seeking to use trails to make longer rides will be directed to the best routes	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of the environmental area improvement	104x

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Unauthorized trail and road decommissioning</p> <p>We support this action as part of a comprehensive plan that establishes an adequate quantity of trails with a diverse range of experience and challenge. Please note our recommended additions to the trail system below. We view these additions as vital and necessary to appropriately addressing the recreational needs for the foreseeable future. Recreational demand and population will continue to grow in the Flagstaff area. Decommissioning of non-system routes will not be effective if not accompanied by proper provision for system routes. The lack of enough trails will compound user conflict issues and can foster discontent amongst some trail users leading to substantial proliferation of unauthorized construction.</p> <p>Please implement trail and road decommissioning after the construction of new routes that are meant to address the demand currently being met by the user-created or historic routes. Additionally please consider managing administrative roads as routes for non-motorized access. Although these roads do not substitute for the experience provided by well-built trails, they can provide access to interesting places in the Forest and some variety when tied together with other trails.</p>	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		trail and road decommissioning	104y
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<p>Hang Glider Launch Site</p> <p>Well-managed recreation has fewer impacts to environmental resources. We support this</p>	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	104z
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Please work with the City of Flagstaff to relocate Schultz Creek Trail Head to the "Schultz 'Y'" City Parcel, thereby providing a 4-season accessible trailhead. Seek an Intergovernmental Agreement with the City of Flagstaff to manage and protect this property as open space and a trailhead. As was evidenced by attendance at the October 28th, 2013, Flagstaff City Council meeting, there is very strong public support for this action. Please note that several very important trails intersect at this location: the Arizona National Scenic Trail, the Flagstaff Loop Trail, the Flagstaff Urban Trail System and Schultz Creek Trail. There may be opportunities to cooperatively manage this area with a trailhead with pit toilets, an interpretive loop trail highlighting environmental and historic features in the area, a mountain bike skills area and/or event staging facilities. We have sent a letter to the City requesting that they partner with the Forest Service. 	Trailhead Improvements		move Schultz creek trailhead to the Y	104aa

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Add a trail between the Schultz Creek Trail Head and the newly proposed Dry Lake Hills Loop. This will add an alternative to both Schultz Creek Trail and Rocky Ridge Trail to help disperse use and minimize user conflicts as well as maximizing the “stacked-loops” concept in the Dry Lake Hills. Additionally, as changes are made to Rocky Ridge trail per its class 3 designation as part of the Arizona Trail and Flagstaff Loop Trail, this trail will serve to replace the challenge opportunity formerly provided by Rocky Ridge. Please note that this trail would serve to replace multiple user created routes in this area, resulting in a net reduction of any environmental impacts. (#1 on our attached map) 	New Trail Construction		add a connector trail	104bb
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Move Lower Brookbank Trail from its currently proposed re-alignment to the east. We have hiked this area extensively and our alignment would make for a much better trail. (See above Comments on the components of the Proposed Action.) (#2 on our attached map) 	Trail Relocation and Improvement		lower brookbank relocation	104cc
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Add upper Red Onion trail into the system in the Preferred Alternative in the Draft Environmental Assessment. Red Onion is a vital connection to the MEDL trail system as it shortcuts the need to climb all the way to the top of Mt Elden to make loops. With the realignment of Upper Oldham, this connection becomes even more valuable. Red Onion is one of the oldest non-system trails in the MEDL area and has a very large amount of support amongst all trail users. Note that Red Onion would need connection across Elden LO Road to Upper Oldham. (#3 on our attached map) 	New Trail Construction		add red onion trail	104dd
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Add Ginger and Jedi Trails to the system. These trails provide an intermediate to advanced experience that is otherwise not available on the system. These trails appeal to a diverse array of riders as they are not built to the same degree of challenge as the downhill mountain bike trails. The Red Rock District has recently incorporated several trails with a similar degree of challenge, (Highline and Hangover for example), which has helped to address this demand in that area. Adding these two trails while eliminating other user created routes nearby will result in a net reduction in impacts in these areas. (#4 and #5 respectively on our attached map) 	New Trail Construction		add ginger and Jedi	104ee

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Add a trail connecting the lower section of Sunset Trail to the top of Lower Brookbank to add further connectivity and versatility to the trail system. When coupled with the Dry Lake Hills Loops and the trail connecting from the DLH Loops to Schultz Creek Trailhead, this will provide an alternative to Schultz Creek Trail which will help to alleviate user conflict issues that continue to grow on Schultz Creek because of its popularity. Although Little Gnarly is a fine route, it is not single-track, it is an exceptionally challenging climb and it connects from a different place from this suggested trail. This trail travels through an area that has several old roads that are frequently used by cyclists. This route would be a better experience than those roads and provide access to this part of the Forest, potentially allowing for a net replacement should these old roads be decommissioned. (#6 on our attached map) 	New Trail Construction		add a connector trail	104ff
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Align the re-designated Class 4 Flagstaff Loop Trail along the foot of Mount Elden on contours along the Pipeline corridor rather than where it is shown in the Proposed Action along Forces of Nature and other trails in the Environmental Study Area (the current FLT alignment). This will minimize impacts to the ESA and is a more appropriate placement for this trail type at the Forest-Community interface. (See above Comments on the components of the Proposed Action.) (#7 on our attached map) 	Trail Relocation and Improvement		Flagstaff loop trail	104gg
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Doney Park Multi-modal study completed in 2011 recommends a FUTS type extension from the end of the FUTS at Snowflake, across Forest Service land to the intersection of Townsend-Winona Road. The analysis for this folds perfectly into the MEDL planning. (#8 on our attached map) 	New Trail Construction		more FUTS trails	104hh
Anthony Quintile	Flagstaff Biking Organization	11/26/2013	Email	Please refer to our attached maps. Pink lines on the map are trails that we are recommending adding to or changing from the Proposed Action. Yellow lines are existing trails that we support decommissioning if appropriate additions are made. Red are trails that we proposed in preliminary scoping that did make it into the Proposed Action. Blue are downhill trails that we proposed in preliminary scoping that did make it into the proposed action. Numbers on the map correspond to the list below.	Other		Attached maps	104ii
Dennis Roostam		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I am a hiker and like the solitude, I understand the urban interface, + hope the privacy of people near the proposed trails is considered.	Other		concern over quality of use	118a
Dennis Roostam		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Do we really want to bring more people to this area. More people will come no matter what, some large scale plan is needed to protect environment + wildlife.	Other		concern over the environmental impacts	118b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Dennis Roostam		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Peace and Quiet is missing. Like the idea of class 3 trails. Keeping speeding mountain bikers to a minimum. Like the large idea of higher trails. Parking?	Other		general concern	118c
Mike Stoddarn		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I would not want to see a class 4 or class 5 trails created behind the shadow mtn area. There are plenty of trails that can be used for a variety of users. Trails that are "too" buffed or manicured take away from what the forest or forest experience should provide. if one wants a urban trail, then use the city urban trail. if possible maintain the trail (existing) would be my preference. all in all would not want a bullrider, with rare trails gravel, or culvert establish in these trail systems. if possible maintain the "single track" type trail that can be recreated by a variety of folks. who is the trail created for, is the questions? locals would be happy with the existing trails, but if the idea is to attract folk then the happy medium is to make the commuter trail as far away from the houses. we enjoy the rougher trails, the forest experience. There is lots and lots of wildlife to consider. there is no need to have the highly paved trails. the rougher trails are fine. and can attract a variety of people as well.	New Trail Construction		concern over new trails	118d
Kent Sherman		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	No. I would rather see new trails established in other areas of the San Francisco peaks area. (north side, Kachina Peaks Wilderness) than rerouting existing trails.	Other		focus efforts in other areas than MEDL	119a
Kent Sherman		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Over 30 years using trail system around buffalo Park, and gas pipeline, Oldham trail areas. I do not have a problem with proposed new trails. My main concern is dogs off leash that create safety and diminished wildlife issues. Since there is a leash law, I would like to see funds that would be spent decommissioning existing and social trails, redirected toward enforcement of leash laws. we have been bitten, threatened, startled by dogs off leash.	Other		concern over dogs off leash	119b
Kent Sherman		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	we have definitely seen a reduction in wildlife viewing in the last 30 years	Other		reduction in wildlife viewing	119c
Linda Sherman		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I disagree with decommissioning historical trails- they are a part of our heritage. Social trails that have formed can be closed, but I think people will continue to hike where they want, so there will be even more trails if you create new ones.	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		against decommissioning trails	50d
Linda Sherman		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Benefits seem good for the downhill mountain bikers, but not so much for hikers and runners. I'm sure the equestrian people will be happy. How about some trails restricted to foot traffic?	Other		general support	50e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Linda Sherman		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	what is missing is enforcement of the leash laws! Dogs off leash are hard on the wildlife and are a nuisance to other hikers and runners. I've been nipped, tripped, and threatened by dogs off leash. I've seen dogs on leash attacked by off leash dogs. It is a safety issue and detracts from the enjoyment of the trails. I'd like to see some of the money go to increased leash law enforcement.	Hang Glider Launch Site		leash law enforcement	50f
Steve Konves		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Additional launch directions would really be great	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	120a
Steve Konves		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	make a S.E. S and West launch with limited extraction of tress. Could we install a wind talker?	Hang Glider Launch Site		launch site suggestions	120b
Scout C- Witulson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Year long access would be nice. Gate with gate code- perhaps a camping area, similar to Mingus mountain. Add a west launch to accommodate weather conditions. Maybe a weather station for pilots to monitor and analyze flying conditions.	Hang Glider Launch Site		launch site suggestions	121
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	FBO has a better plan but I like that the forest service has incorporated a lot of recreation uses. 1)red onion 2) Jedi 3) climb 3 connection 4) new trail from DLH loop proposal to connect to Schultz creek 4)ginger 5)establish a trail crew trail fund 6) follow other communities with successful programs/rails	Other		Support for FBO's plan	122
Thomas Robison		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I support the Flagstaff Biking Organization plan given to you by Anthony Q. In addition, make trail care a priority for this district. Most of our trails stand neglected and under maintained.	Other		Support for FBO's plan	110m
James McFadden		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I believe the concepts proposed are excellent and will improve recreational activates and safety for equestrians, bikers, and hikers. I really like the b buffalo park trail	Other		general support	123
mark Haughwout		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Some of the best trails are 'social trails" (such as dogfood/Jedi/lost burrito). I would hate to see these trails closed. I would like to see the forest service have a designation for social trails that would allow them to remain, but not be designated for complete forest service maintenance. allowing them to be user maintained system trails. maybe something like an "adopt-a - trail" program where trained volunteers would adopt a trail to maintain/fix it.	New Trail Construction		support of including social trails	124a
mark Haughwout		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	the main improvement will be making upper Oldham and lower brookbank trails rideable in both directions. Uphill travel is currently impossible on both trails.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of improving upper Oldham and lower brookbank	124b
J M Fall		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I support eh whole concept. Especially the AZ trail improvement at buffalo park.				125
Ray		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	yes	Other		general support	126
Lucinda Tephany		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Yes	other		general support	127
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	current signage is patchy and mostly unreadable. This is fine for folks who use the trails often, but visitors may become confused.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of increase signage	128

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	love the idea of new trails. Designating a few trails for downhill seems like a good idea to reduce user conflict. Also happy with realignments for environmental protection.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		general support	129
Bob Brunswick		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	any improvements at the Y include a restroom of some kind? Restroom at Elden lookout trail. Better display maps of trails at the trailhead	Trailhead Improvements		support of trailhead improvements	130
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Put the majority of development/funding toward the trails, not so much toward the trailhead development i.e. no trash service, only pit toilets at the most developed trail heads. (fat mans, Schultz creek) no pavement, simple signage.	Other		money towards trails not trailheads	131a
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	would be nice to eliminate unauthorized trails or at least have more signage for official trails to avoid confusion	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		unauthorized trails	131b
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	more signage and unauthorized trail closure would enhance one's outdoor experience and prevent one from getting lost	Trail Relocation and Improvement		increased signage	132a
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Limiting events with prevent overuse and abuse of trails and trailheads	Special-Use Trail Events		against special use permits	132b
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	yes	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of flagstaff loop/lower oldhamn/scenic loop	133
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	yes, more trails	New Trail Construction		support of equestrian emphasis area	134
BJ Boyle		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Please consider a southeast launch as well as a West launch. Only a few dead trees would be need to improve the site. The pilots are in full support of any improvements considered and appreciate the ability to comment.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	135
Scout Warren		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	add a west, south, and southeast launch for paragliding/hang gliding	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	136
Jerome naleski		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I am in favor and support of the FBO trail addition, realignment, and or moving of trails. I would like the system to be able to expand. See attached copy of FBO's proposed map.	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	35n
Mark Knight		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	If additional directions to launching, hang gliders, it would make the mountain safer and more useful. Hang gliding is restricted by wind direction. By opening more directions, Mount Elden would be less risky and promote a safe hang gliding area. remove some dead trees at the current launch site to promote safety. Improving the parking and access paths would put less impact on the area.	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	100d
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	great to provide a south trail. Benefit will be more accessible to "avg" or "beg" mtn bikers. Nice to have some cat 3 stuff that is scenic. Will need to think how to make sure increased traffic in the area is managed. Parking, no negative impacts on adjacent neighborhoods. signage. don't want S + R to be too busy.	New Trail Construction		support of south trail	137
Jeff Martin		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	more trails, better access, improved signage	Other		general support	138

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Tim Varner		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I believe people will continue to use unauthorized trails and create new ones. One of the greatest impacts I have noticed over the years has been from people not cleaning up after their dogs.	Other		general concerns	139
Michael Varderberg		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	there could be some greater emphasis put on the downhill "or fall line" trail system that is proposed. Namely there could be more trail miles to accommodate the users. More downhill trails. I think it is important to have these built in the most sustainable manner w/the USFS.	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trail construction	140
Theodore Beeur		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I would advocate for the FBO recommended changes. 1) realign along the base of Mt. Elden (forces of nature) 2) don't move brookbank quiet so far west 3) a Schultz connector (lost burrito?)	Other		support of FBO's proposed plan	141a
Theodore Beeur		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please make sure the horse trailer parking is pull through as illustrated	Trailhead Improvements		horse trailer parking	141b
Kyle Doherty		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	currently there are numerous technical trails coming off the dry lakes hills. These trails are a critical resource for the group of cyclists who aren't full on downhillers, but value technical climbs and technical descents. In particular, the ginger trail is a unique riding experience and could be improved, if adopted. preserving multiple descents off of the dry lakes hills will serve to diffuse traffic on the mountain. in particular these options would provide users with many loops that start and end on the south side of the dry lakes, diverting traffic from the over-crowded Schultz trail. please preserve the ginger trail and keep it distinct from the lower brookbank re-route.				142
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	more trails for biking and to help eliminate unauthorized trails caused by mountain biking	New Trail Construction		support of new trail construction	143
Burcham Hale		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	benefit is safer launches for hang gliders	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	144
kevin Olcon		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I strongly support FBO's proposals. I feel more trails and loops will open up more room for more trail users, and a more enjoyable experience for all user groups. I especially feel red onion trail is essential for this.	New Trail Construction		support of FBO proposal and keeping red onion trail	145
karne Malis-Clark		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	good to see future investment in Elden ESA. Flagstaff folks have been wondering about condition of the ESA Trails.	Mount Elden Environmental Study Area (ESA) Improvements		support of improvements to ESA	146
Joanne Keene		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I would like to see the flagstaff loop trail connector higher up on the trails after it leaves the pipeline. As a resident who lives off the pipeline I am concerned about a class 4 trail so close to homes (100 yards of our gate) please consider a trail that is higher up or consider a less wide trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	147a
Joanne Keene		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	support the brookbank reroute and extending the loop trails. Concern is the type of trail connecting the pipeline to forces of nature .	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of brookbank reroute	147b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
John comer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	would really like to see some of the unsustainable downhill mtb trails decommissioned	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		decommission some mtb trails	148a
John comer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	a little concerned about increased traffic on flagstaff loop trail near Appalachian road out house is barely 100 yards from the proposed trail. There are two parallel trails farther up Elden that I would request to be considered instead.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		concern over flagstaff loop trail	148b
John comer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	if red onion could be made sustainable I'd like it to be kept in the trails system.	New Trail Construction		keep red onion	148c
John comer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	very excited about lower brookbank reroute. New trail to dry lakes from bottom of lower Oldham sounds great, can it be bikable?	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of lower brookbank reroute.	148d
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Keep "red onion" and "Jedi/ken-I"	New Trail Construction		keep red onion and Jedi	149
Jim Gibson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I'd like all existing trails in the area kept, perhaps improved, i.e. red onion. Only concern is losing trails in important areas.	New Trail Construction		keep red onion	150a
Charlie bendy		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	turning the section of the loop trail at the base of Mt. Elden into a FUTS quality trail through fare feels like overkill. I know that it is heavily used, but it would be nice to maintain the feel of being out in nature. A FUTS type trail doesn't feel like nature.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	151a
Charlie bendly		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	many of the social trails exist for a reason. They often provide connections that are otherwise missing. Red onion is an example. Please consult the proposal presented by FBO.	New Trail Construction		support of including social trails	151b
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Brookbank trail definitely need a re-route, good thinking. I like that brookbank will take traffic off Elden LO road.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of brookbank reroute	152
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please don't decommission red onion it is a great connector trail and will be important on the brookbank re-route to connect to little bear and make brookbank a loop.	New Trail Construction		include red onion	153
Cathy Steers		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	yes it improves current trails and adds significant mileage which is more rideable/hike able.	Other		general support	154
Lionel Martiez		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	more signage and educational literature to inform the public about the trails being multi purpose	Other		general support	155
James Brootes		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please leave forces of nature as is. We want on contour FUTs trail connecting west flag to east flag in the sunny portion of south Elden. Use pipeline and add on contour traverse to accomplish but leave forces of nature as is.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	156
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I would rather see weatherford trail re-routed and improved or upper oldham re-routed and improved. Constructing an entire trail, rather than refurbishing well-used trails seems like a waste of resources. Other improvements seem very beneficial to the trail system as a whole.	New Trail Construction		against south Elden trail	157
James Brooks		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please adopt red onion. It is fantastic access to sunset/ I/ bear trails w/o going all the way up/ please adopt pickle and ginger for various ride routes across and off of dry lakes hills. Please adopt Jedi into the system. what is missing is a true perimeter trail around dry lake hills as close to the ridge as possible.	New Trail Construction		keep social trails	158

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Kip Moyer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	leave forces of nature and the trails that connect to the Elden lookout trail the way they area currently and build a class 4 trail on contour that connects from buffalo park and loop trail over to Elden lookout trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		flagstaff loop trail	48h
anonymous		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	absorb pickle, ginger, and Jedi into the plan. But leave their essence. (i.e. ramps, logs, jumps, etc.)	New Trail Construction		include social trails	159
Jim Gibson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please do not take away forces of nature for FUTS. I support FUTS wholeheartedly, but want it done to preserve existing trails at the base of Elden.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		keep forces of nature	150b
steven gibson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	yes downhilling is a huge recreational need in flagstaff	New Trail Construction		support of downhill trails	160
Jim gibson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	just would like to see more downhill trails, so important for our community	New Trail Construction		support of more down hill trails	150c
Joe Armstrong		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	worried about people flying up and down Elden Lookout rd., both paved and dirt. Recommend drainage dips and speed hump.	Other		Elden Lookout road	161a
chuck Brunz		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	red onion- we really need it. Many people can manage riding all the way up to the top and have to ride down hobbit down. Please add red onion	New Trail Construction		keep red onion	162a
chuck Brunz		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	connector from sunset to little bear. The would create multiple loop options.	New Trail Construction		connector trail	162b
Cori Morse		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	missing and intermediate to advanced non-technical uphill trail to avoid hiker/biker/vehicle traffic up and down Elden lookout road.	New Trail Construction		new trial idea	163
Joe Armstrong		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Elden lookout road needs attention so that people will respect the speed limits. Its narrow and currently people fly up and down.	Other		concern over Elden lookout road	161b
Kip Moyer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	expand the dry lake hills loop to connect into ginger and Jedi. Adopt Jedi and ginger. Connect dry lakes hill sloop to new trail on south face. add a trail that starts at Schultz creek trailhead and rocky ridge intersection and connect it via south face of dry lake hills loop. This will add more multi-use options to access dry lake hills	New Trail Construction		dry lake hills loop	48i
Kip Moyer		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please adopt pickle and make a system trail. Adopt red onion to improve access to trail system. Adopt wasabi as system trial for DH or multi-purpose use. Add a trail connecting sunset to upper brookbank. When adopting social trails it would be good to improve and make them more sustainable.	New Trail Construction		suggestions on new trails to add	48j
Patrick Kell		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I suggest that the downhill trails are professional designed and build with professional oversight. I recommend that downhill trails are built predominately using advanced rock armoring techniques to ensure long term safety and sustainability.	New Trail Construction		downhill trails	164
Jim Gibson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	would like to see all existing trails kept/improved. Jedi, ginger, red onion, and pickle.	New Trail Construction		keep existing trails	150d

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jim Gibson		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	please improved the hart trail. Re-route so that bikes can use it. It's in a great location and would connect a number of possible loops.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		improve hart trail	140e
Jeremy Morse		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I think having some additional trails (or re-alignments) that offer improved uphill biking alternatives to the Elden lookout road are drastically needed. If the proposed trail along Elden (devils head) is built with a moderate grade, as well a moderate technical level it would add new loop opportunities, as well as reduce shuttle traffic on the road. if it is too technical, it will become another area of user conflict.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		new trail ideas	6j
Jeremy Morse		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	dedicated user specific trails.	Other		user specific trails	6k
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I support efforts to realign the north facing trail from Buffalo Park. It is steep and rocky and muddy; definitely not for kids or intermediate riders. Like plan to realign pipeline trail.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of realigning trails	164a
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Please focus on well-built trails that don't need constant maintenance. Lower Oldham north of pipeline needs some rerouting. It is very eroded in sections. Add in a trail through forest that parallels pipeline trail to west. Current alignment is heavily ridden and a decent trail in most places.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of re-alignment of trails	164b
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	would like to see small network of trials in a read north of Appalachian/skyline. This area is heavily used by dog owners/hikers who may not be interested in passing through but only doing a little loop through the forest.	New Trail Construction		new trail ideas	164c
chuck Brunz		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	what always is a problem is connecting between trails. If we could create more loops of different length for MTB, equestrian, hikers, etc. the area would be so much better.	New Trail Construction		more loop trails	162c
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	less confusion at sunset/Schultz trailheads/ excellent idea to combine them.	Trailhead Improvements		support of combing Schultz trailheads	164d
Mark Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	there could be more small well placed connector trails for shorter "dog walking" type hikes. The mainly biking trails are only a couple going east and west. These should become real trails and made less likely to erode. .	New Trail Construction		more connector trails	165a
Mark Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	The upper trails such as sunset and green onion need work before they grow even wider. I know that the section of sunset below the ridge, known as the Hobbit forest is popular with a few riders, but there should be a more ridable and walkable alternate route	Trail Relocation and Improvement		improve social trails	165b
Mark Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	there need to be better signage, but I recognize the problems with vandalism so I support efforts towards improvements.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of increased signage	165c
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Would like to suggest an alternate route to current alignment of sunset through Hobbit forest (between Little Beer junction and heart trail junction). Current trail requires extensive dismounting and walking of bikes due to extreme riding conditions. Would like less technical route from ridge to Little Bear Junction.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		alternate route suggestion	164e

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Let's focus on building/realigning trails that are "self-maintain"	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of improving trails	164f
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Very happy with the plan to realign brookbank. It is unridable at the moment due to erosion.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of re-aligning brookbank	164g
Jennifer Spinti		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I'm also pleased with the upper Oldham realignment, especially if the grade makes it rideable, right now its only suitable for downhillers who are crazy.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		support of upper Oldham realignment	164h
Jim McGeorge		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	all signage and education will need to be upgraded.	Trail Relocation and Improvement		increased signage	166a
Jim McGeorge		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	this will require even more parking space than the plan provides.	Trailhead Improvements		more parking	166b
Jim McGeorge		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	Decommission of all social trails	Unauthorized Trail and Road Decommissioning		decommission social trails	166c
Jim McGeorge		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	trail patrol of all users with additional users will be very important. Uses will need additional funding for this and trail maintenance.	Other		concerned over patrolling of trails	166e
Marty Lee		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I assume use will increase as a result of publicity, etc. more strain on resources, need additional funding, trail patrols, etc. impacts will increase. r	Other		concern of over use	167a
Marty Lee		11/18/2013	Comment Sheet	I am pleased to see the expansion of equestrian opportunities and some consideration of parking area.	New Trail Construction		support of equestrian trails	166b
John Paul Roccaforte		12/6/2013	Email	my main concern with the project have to with the potential for redundant rails in the project area. I do not see the need for additional trails where there are existing trails which are sufficient. Specifically, I am referring to the are of proposed trail shown on Map 6 which is southwest of the existing pipeline trail. as it is currently drawn on the map, it appears that the propose trail diverges from the pipeline trail before it should in my opinion. I feel that it would make more sense to use the existing pipeline trail as the flagstaff loop trail until the pipeline trail gets too steep, about 1/4 -1/3 of a mile further to the northwest than is currently shown o the map. this would save money and materials, and would avoid an additional scar on the landscape. In, addition it would avoid having the trail run close to the houses on East Appalachian Rd. which could be a potential safety concern for residents. I can understand having the trail diverge where the pipeline trail gets to steep, but wanted to express my concerns about the existing location.	Trail Relocation and Improvement	Map 6: Proposed New Trail, Flagstaff Loop Trail Improvement/R eclassification, and Realignment of Lower Oldham	concern over the pipeline trail location	167
Chris Weigel		11/16/2013	Email	it is my sincere hope that safety improvements for the hang gliding and paragliding launches can be part of the improvement on Mt. Elden	Hang Glider Launch Site		support of hang glider launch site	168
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	Please define the management relationship between the revised forest plan, watershed project and this recreational plan.	Other		concern over forest plans	169a
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	how will enforcement of the plan and preventing illegal trail building be handled?	Other		concern over enforcing building of illegal trails	169b

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	reducing access, particularly the downhill shuttles, will promote the non-motorized recreational aspect of the current forest plan.	Other		minimize motorized use	169c
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	place a year round locked gate at the 'climbers parking lot' that only via permit can be opened for events or service personnel. This will eliminate the need for the upper trailhead/parking/gate and new trails around turkey park.	New Trail Construction		against climbing access	169d
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	please consider eliminating parking at the current Y location- both national forest and city of Flagstaff.	Trailhead Improvements		decommission Y parking	169e
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	Decommission and rehab the Schultz Creek Trail- it is one of the few remaining water sources on the peaks.	Other		decommission Schultz creek trail	169f
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	create a concessioner campground and 70-vehicle parking lot on 164B which would be the main access to the MEDL. This would eliminate the high volume of traffic created by your plan for the residence along Mt. Elden rd.	Other		campground	169g
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	gate Schultz rd. on the west side of the proposed parking area so more people use the access point.	Other		gate Schultz rd.	169h
Joe shannon		11/23/0213	Email	find alternate areas for the down-hilling crowd. It appears this plan has given over the entire MT. Elden trail system to the most destructive recreational activity without a motor. Although for 50% of the time they do need motors to get up to the top of their routes. please explain how you rationalize this in light of the non-motorized directive you listed in the project background. Very Inconsistent management planning.	New Trail Construction		against downhill trails	169i
Scott Heinsius	Cosmic Cycles	11/15/2013	Email	I am generally in support of the project, but my main concern is an increased level of exploitation. Flagstaff and the peaks area, I feel, is n the cusp of major mainstream, and I feel like the development should be treated gently. It is great to promote these healthy activist and the local economy to greater public, but at what price? I am sure you have seen how Sedona has grown in the last couple years, it is almost circus-like to go down there on weekends. Many of the proposed project ideas are needed, but some seem a bit extreme to me such as clearing a five acre area on Elden for hang gliding, but I am not involved whatsoever in the hang gliding community, therefore I am somewhat in the dark as far as need for this.	Other		concern of exploiting MEDL area	170
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	new bike/hike trail construction using the blue dot trail cooridor	New Trail Construction	Map 6: Proposed New Trail, Flagstaff Loop Trail Improvement/R eclassification, and Realignment of Lower Oldham	new trail idea	171

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	add jedi to the trail system	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	keep jedi	172
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	add red onion to the trail system	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	keep red onion	173
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	optional route for sunset through the "hobbit forest"	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	optional route through hobbit forest	174
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	keep winene walk trail	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	keep social trail	175
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	new brookbank trail should be in the same drainange and using "pickle" as a new trail route	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	brookbank reroute	176

Commenter	Organization	Date	Format	Comment	Category	Map Number (1-8, optional)	Summary	Comment #
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	Keep lost burrito trail	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	Keep Lost Burrito Trail	177
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	starting at schultz creek and rocky ridge intersection connecting to dry lake hills loop could adopt parts of lost burrito trail.	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	add lost burrito to dry lake hills loop	178
anonymous		11/18/2013	Drawn on Map	add miles to dry lake hills loop	New Trail Construction	Map 3: Proposed Realignment of Brookbank & Upper Oldham and Proposed Dry Lake Hills Loops	more miles to dry lake hills loop	179